

Meeting of the
CALIFORNIA STATE PARK and RECREATION COMMISSION
Berkeley Marina Radisson Hotel – Islands Ballroom
200 Marina Boulevard
Berkeley, California

Minutes of the Meeting - Friday, December 6, 2002

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT

Joseph Cotchett, Chairman
Raquelle de la Rocha
Caryl Hart, Vice Chair
Clint Eastwood
Paul Junger Witt

COMMISSIONERS ABSENT

Bobby Shriver

STAFF PRESENT

Bill Berry, Deputy Director, Park Operations
Ruth Coleman, Acting Director
Robin Ettinger, Project Manager
Brian Hickey, Sector Superintendent, Mount Diablo
Tim La Franchi, Chief Council
Louis Nastro, Assistant to the State Park and Recreation Commission
Rick Rayburn, Chief, Natural Resources Division
Ron Schafer, District Superintendent, Bay Area District
Roy Stearns, Deputy Director, Communications

CONSULTING STAFF

Steve Hammond, Wallace, Roberts & Todd (WRT) Inc.
Don Neuwirth, Neuwirth Consulting

ELECTED OFFICIALS

Tom Bates, Mayor of Berkeley
Nora Davis, Emeryville City Councilmember
Loni Hancock, Assemblymember, 14th Assembly District
Allan Maris, Albany City Councilmember

VISITORS REGISTERED/REPRESENTING

Mike Adney/Berkeley Lions
Wendy Alfsen/Walk & Roll Berkeley
Jeremy Anson/Individual
Bob Arnold/Individual

Tim Bean/U.C. Berkeley, Cal Adventures
Georgia Becker/Individual
Ed Bennet/Individual
Sue Beyer/Individual
Carol Bledsoe/Individual
Larry Blum/Individual
Gerardo Blum/BMX Riders
Frazer Bradshaw/Individual
Shiela Cain/Individual
Lucile F. Cain/Individual
Roger Carlsen/Albany Little League
Robert Cheasty/Citizens for the Eastshore State Park (CESP)
Rich Clark/Individual
Lisa Corona/City of Berkeley
Jane Coulter/League of Women Voters of the Bay Area
Patty Donald/Individual
Robert E. Doyle/East Bay Regional Park District
Arthur Feinstein /Golden Gate Audubon Society
David R. Fielder/Individual
Douglas Fielding/Association of Sports Field Users
Neal Fishman/California State Coastal Conservancy
Andrew Gilbert/Individual
Ellen Goldblatt/Albany Let It Be
Julie Graves/Citizens for Albany Shoreline
Jeremy Hanson/BMX Riders
Norma Harrison/Individual
Rex Higginbotham/Albany Little League
Paul Johnson/Individual
Paul Kamen/Berkeley Waterfront Commission
Claudia Kawczynski/Berkeley Waterfront Commission
Norman LaForce/Sierra Club
Susan Levine/Albany Let It Be
Greg Lyman/Albany Berkeley Girls Softball League
Elena Maroth/Individual
Jim McGrath/Individual
Kitty McLean/Individual
Keith Miller/Jack London Aquatic Center, Oakland Public Schools
Bob Muzzy/Individual
Karin Nelson/Albany Waterfront Committee
Osha Neumann/Albany Let It Be
Briggs Nisbet/Save The Bay
Marybeth Novak/Albany Let It Be
Casey Nutt/Individual
Pat O'Brien/East Bay Regional Park District
Fletcher Oakes/Individual
Jill Posener/Albany Let It Be
Nancy Powell/Bay Access
Mimi Pennell/BMX Riders
Bill Prinzmetal/Individual

Dorothy Radcliffe/Seabreeze
Marilyn Saarni/Individual
Anthony Sandberg/OCSC Sailing
Saul Schumsky/Cal Sailing Club
Susan Schwartz/Friends of Five Creeks & Berkeley Path Wanderers
Jim Simmons/Citizens for the Albany Shoreline (CAS)
Jean Siri/East Bay Regional Park District
Marsha Skinner/Individual
Alison Smith/Individual
Phil Smith/Individual
Barbara Speed/Individual
Phillip Stahlman/Individual
Shay Stephen/Urban Roots Prop.
Stephen Swanson/Individual
Susan Synarski/Individual
David I. Tam/Individual
Peter Thorner/San Francisco Boardsailing Association
Will Travis/San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission
Jessie Washington/Richmond Parks Department
Martin Wendt/BMX Riders
Richard Wolgast/Individual
Margie Young/Individual
Eleanor Yukic/PIDO

CALL TO ORDER

Legal notice having been given, the California State Park and Recreation Commission meeting was called to order at 9:36 a.m. by Chairman Joseph Cotchett. Chairman Cotchett introduced each of the commissioners present. Chairman Cotchett then introduced visiting guests including: Assemblymember Loni Hancock, Berkeley Mayor Tom Bates, Albany City Councilman and former Mayor of Albany, Allan Maris, Nora Davis, City Councilmember from Emeryville, Lisa Corona, Director of Parks and Recreation for the City of Berkeley, Beverly Lane, member of the East Bay Regional Park District Board, and Will Travis, Executive Director of the San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission. Chairman Cotchett then introduced Acting Director Ruth Coleman and Deputy Director of Park Operations Bill Berry.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Acting Director Ruth Coleman was called away to a conference call regarding the State budget, so Bill Berry, Deputy Director of Park Operations gave the Director's report in her absence. Acting Director Coleman rejoined the meeting in progress.

Deputy Director Berry commented that over the Thanksgiving holiday, California State Parks experienced unprecedented attendance. The public continues to visit parks in increasing numbers and the expectation is this will continue no matter how bad the economy gets. This year and next the Department is headed into very difficult budget times, and State Parks is doing everything it can to prepare for potential budget deficits.

Cultural Summit – State Parks co-sponsored a Cultural Summit in Southern California in which cultural specialists from throughout the nation gathered to evaluate where State Parks was in managing and protecting the cultural history of California. Museum directors, historians, doctors of philosophy,

and many other cultural history specialists gathered at the Getty Museum for a two and a half day seminar to look at where parks are and where California is in the preservation of its own history. The summit focused on the future of California's heritage. It included historic sites, art museums, collections, archives, archeological preserves, and literature. The summit provided an opportunity to form new partnerships and plan for the future in terms of where the Department can go, whether budget times are good or bad.

Acquisitions – California State Parks and the Baldwin Hills Conservancy announced the acquisition last month of the first in a series of parcels along the Stockard Street corridor, a mile long series of parcels in Baldwin Hills that has remained undeveloped. The preservation of this corridor is part of an ongoing effort to extend Kenneth Hahn State Recreation Area.

Chairman Cotchett clarified that Baldwin Hills is the hill mass in the center of Los Angeles where a great many oil derricks are.

Deputy Director Berry then discussed the second acquisition, the Cowell Ranch property in Contra Costa County. Just as the Department is forming a partnership with the East Bay Regional Parks District regarding Eastshore State Park, the Cowell Ranch is another place where the Department expects to partner with East Bay Regional Parks District. There are many adjacent parcels and trails that link to each other. The Cowell Ranch property encompasses 3,865 acres near the community of Brentwood, just south of Antioch. The Ranch surrounds the historic 1856 home and property of Dr. John Marsh. He was believed to be Contra Costa County's first U.S. citizen was one of the first medical doctors to provide services to the folks in this rugged territory when it was first being established.

Personnel – Following the retirement of Steve Treanor, Ted Jackson has been appointed new Southern Division Chief for State Parks. Jackson was the Superintendent of the South San Joaquin Valley District, and has been working for California State Parks for many years. He will oversee the six districts in Southern California.

Russ Guiney retired and has moved on to become the Chief Deputy Director of the Los Angeles County Department of Parks and Recreation.

Will Rogers State Park – A \$5.3 million dollar renovation has begun at Will Rogers State Historic Park in Pacific Palisades. It will include major work at the 31-room ranch house, stables, blacksmith shop, and hay barn. The flagstone patio and walkways surrounding the main house will be restored. The park will remain open during restoration, and the Department hopes to reopen the house in 2004.

Malibu Pier – This project is in its final phase, which includes the complete restoration of the historic buildings to match their original condition in 1945. The Pier suffered storm damage many years ago but the reconstruction is now nearly finished. Once completed, the restaurants will re-open and services will again be available to the public.

Chairman Cotchett thanked Deputy Director Berry for the report.

RETIREMENT CERTIFICATES

Chairman Cotchett commented that one of the most important tasks performed at Commission meetings the acknowledgement of the State Park Rangers and other Parks employees that keep our parks open. Chairman Cotchett further commented that State Park Rangers work under very difficult conditions and for salaries that not many people would work for. They are as much law enforcement as any CHP officer or any other peace officer and they everyday work for the benefit of the public in these state parks. Then Chairman Cotchett asked Ron Schafer, District Superintendent for the Bay Area to read the names of the rangers and other staff that are retiring.

Superintendent Schafer thanked Chairman Cotchett, and read the retirement certificates for the following department employees:

Robert Anderson	31 Years 2 Months
Lynn Anderson	23 Years 9 Months
Antone Duncan	27 Years 3 Months
Paul Hladik	31 Years
Bob La Belle	34 Years 2 Months
John Lunday	27 Years 9 Months
Michael McComas	29 Years 1 Month
Glenn McGowan	31 Years 7 Months
Mary Morris	38 Years
Walter Saylor	28 Years 10 Months
Jimmy Smallwood	36 Years 3 Months
Steve Treanor	29 Years 10 Months
Joann Weiler	28 Years 10 Months
Timothy Young	26 Years 10 Months

RESOLUTION TO RECOGNIZE THEODORE A. (TED) BRAVOS

Chairman Cotchett thanked Superintendent Schafer. Chairman Cotchett then stated that the Commission wished to recognize Theodore (Ted) Bravos, who was instrumental in acquiring property for Jack London State Historic Park. Mr. Bravos was not present. The Commission honored Mr. Bravos with a resolution recognizing his contribution to State Parks. Chairman Cotchett asked that the Commission unanimously honor Mr. Bravos, and each Commissioner agreed.

APPROVAL OF MEMORIAL REDWOOD GROVES

Commissioner Cotchett explained that the Memorial Groves are named for people who have contributed a great deal to help the environment. Commissioner Cotchett asked Vice-Chair Caryl Hart to give the names of the Memorial Groves to be approved at this meeting. Vice-Chair Hart commented that the Memorial Grove requests were to be approved by her fellow Commissioners. She read the proclamation from the Save-the-Redwoods League requesting the establishment of these groves, which are named at the request of individuals who have made generous donations. Vice-Chair Hart read the names and locations of the groves.

As requested by Save-the-Redwoods League:

Harper, Grove, Robison, Henshall Memorial Grove in Humboldt Redwoods State Park
Mr. & Mrs. Jack Henshall, donors

David and Marlene Buck Grove in Navarro River Redwoods State Park
Mr. David Buck, donor

Chairman Cotchett asked for a motion to approve the resolution establishing these groves. Motion Vice-Chair Hart, second Commissioner Witt. The commissioners voted unanimously to approve the establishment of these memorial redwood groves.

PUBLIC HEARING

Chairman Cotchett opened the public meeting 9:55 a.m.

Approval of the Preliminary General Plan and Environmental Impact Report (EIR) for the Eastshore Project

Chairman Cotchett again introduced Ron Schafer, District Superintendent for the Bay Area, and then briefly reviewed the process that would take place during this portion of the meeting.

Superintendent Schafer thanked Chairman Cotchett. Superintendent Schafer then commented on the uniqueness of the Eastshore park. He detailed the partnerships involved, naming the East Bay Regional Park District (EBRPD), the California State Coastal Conservancy, California State Parks, the five cities in which the park property resides: Oakland, Emeryville, Berkeley, Albany, and Richmond, and a multitude of (unnamed) stakeholder groups. Then Superintendent Schafer introduced Neal Fishman from the State Coastal Conservancy.

Mr. Fishman explained the history of Coastal Conservancy's involvement with the East Bay Shoreline. He expressed his satisfaction with the planning process that took place, and he explained that the plan combines urban uses as well as the protection and restoration of resources. Mr. Fishman commented that this is just the beginning of this effort, and that the Coastal Conservancy plans to be a partner in this project for many years to come.

Chairman Cotchett added that Berkeley's new Mayor, Tom Bates, should be singled out as an individual who helped create this park by introducing legislation as an assemblymember in 1992.

Superintendent Schafer then introduced Pat O'Brien, General Manager of the East Bay Regional Park District.

Mr. O'Brien explained that the East Bay Regional Park District (EBRPD) has worked in partnership for many years with State Parks and other State agencies. Of the 93,000 acres EBRPD operates in the East Bay, 10,000 of those acres are in partnership with the State. Mr. O'Brien expressed that this plan represents a collective vision, and that it balances many diverse interests. Mr. O'Brien went on to say that this urban park will provide a unique opportunity to have thousands of people become stakeholders in this park and supporters of State Parks.

Superintendent Schafer introduced the steering committee of this project:

Bob Doyle, East Bay Regional Parks District

Larry Tong, Interagency Planner/Planning Manager EBRPD (not present)

Tom Mikelson, Assistant General Manager for Planning and Stewardship EBRPD

Brenda Buxton, State Coastal Conservancy

Brian Hickey, State Parks Superintendent for the Diablo Sector

Robin Ettinger, Project Manager

Don Neuwirth, Neuwirth & Associates

Steven Hammond, Director of Planning for Wallace, Roberts & Todd (WRT)

Superintendent Schafer then introduced project consultants Don Neuwirth and Steve Hammond to present the general plan for the Eastshore Project.

Mr. Neuwirth and Mr. Hammond presented a slide show detailing the proposed general plan. It included a history of conservation efforts in the Bay, and an explanation of the various areas and resources within the park and the issues that were raised during the planning process. The presentation also described the major areas of the park property and the proposals for each area. Mr. Neuwirth and Mr. Hammond emphasized that the proposed plan is the result of a collaborative process between State Parks, East Bay Regional Parks, the Coastal Conservancy, and extensive public participation program.

Classification and Naming of the Eastshore Project as Three Units of the State Park System

Mr. Neuwirth introduced Rick Rayburn, Division Chief for Natural Resources at State Parks.

Mr. Rayburn explained that three classifications are being proposed for the Eastshore Project property, and that the proposal establishes three units. The recommendation for the primary Eastshore unit is that it be named “Eastshore State Park,” and that it be classified as a State Seashore.

Mr. Rayburn then explained the other two units are recommended classification as State Marine Reserves: the Emeryville Crescent State Marine Reserve and the Albany State Marine Reserve. The proposed reserves total about 600 acres. Consequences of the State Marine Reserve classification are that it would not allow the commercial or recreational taking of resources in these areas. The proposed State Marine Reserves represent about one-third of the marine area of the Eastshore property. Two-thirds of remaining portion of the underwater areas would remain open for some form of recreational fishing.

Chairman Cotchett thanked Mr. Rayburn and proposed a brief break before the public comment period. Chairman Cotchett also expressed the importance of being brief during the public comments as there were over 70 people registered to speak. Chairman Cotchett would start the public comment period with the elected officials.

Public Comment on the Preliminary General Plan and EIR and Classification and Naming of the Eastshore Project as Three Units of the State Park System

Chairman Cotchett first called on the elected officials and government representatives that were present:

Tom Bates, Mayor of Berkeley – Mayor Bates welcomed the Commission to Berkeley. He stated his approval of the plan, the suggestion of the name and the suggestion of the designation. He indicated that although this was not a perfect plan, he recognized that it is not a finished product and that there are funding issues. Mayor Bates further expressed that the planning process has been fair, with numerous opportunities for people to express themselves. Mayor Bates stated that this plan deserves the Commission’s support and he urged the Commission to approve it. Mayor Bates added that the City of Berkeley looks forward to working together with State Parks in implementing the plan.

Loni Hancock, 14th Assembly District – Assemblymember Hancock stated that funding the future of this project will be a cooperative effort, and that there is some bond money available. Assemblymember Hancock went on to express that with the establishment of this park, it would realize the vision of what would be the largest urban waterfront park in California. She told the commissioners that the stakeholders have compromised in the plan, which is very ambitious. Assemblymember Hancock acknowledged that it will take a number of years to realize, and she pledged to work with everyone that needs to be involved, to ensure flexibility to make adjustments as needed. Assemblymember Hancock thanked everyone for being there, and expressed her hope that the plan be adopted.

Allan Maris, Albany City Councilmember – Councilman Maris described the development of the Albany Waterfront, which gradually evolved from a dump into a nature area that should be preserved. Councilman Maris expressed his support for the plan as proposed, and the support of the Albany City Council. He also indicated that a number of Albany sports users groups supported the plan. Councilman Maris voiced his request for an area to create art in the park, and thanked the planners for their work in the process. Councilman Maris noted that the City of Albany still owns the “bulb” portion of the park and that they would be pleased to see that resource transferred to the State as soon as possi-

ble. Councilman Maris also asked that the State support the city's local authorities regarding sports fields as they are greatly needed for after-school youth activities.

Nora Davis, Emeryville City Councilmember – Councilmember Davis stated she was representing the City of Emeryville, and she urged the Commission to act affirmatively on the issues before them today. She indicated the city's support of the plan with one exception regarding a very small piece of land that is currently proposed for a parking lot.

Lisa Corona, City of Berkeley, Director of Parks – Ms. Corona stated that she recognized the process and time that went into developing this plan. Ms. Corona stated that the Berkeley City Council supports the park name and classification as proposed. She indicated the City is very happy the plan includes much-needed recreational elements. Ms. Corona expressed concern regarding the design phase of the State Park, indicating that it will be critical to conduct those meetings so the local population can attend. Ms. Corona stated it is the City's understanding that the public will have input in the design process. Ms. Corona noted that this park is part of a network of open space including several City parks, and the goal is to make the boundaries as seamless as possible for park visitors. Ms. Corona indicated the importance of working together to resolve issues that may come up during the development of the park. Ms. Corona stated that the City of Berkeley encourages and supports this plan. She thanked the design team for their help.

Will Travis, San Francisco BCDC – Mr. Travis stated that BCDC is the Coastal Commission for the Bay. As a state agency, the facilities in the park will need a permit from BCDC. Mr. Travis stated that it was not an insurmountable problem because the plan is consistent with BCDC's San Francisco Bay plan. He indicated the Eastshore plan represents a compromise of many views, and that it achieves a balance between conservation and development. Mr. Travis urged the Commission to approve the plan for the new Eastshore State Park. He added that his wife, his daughter, and his dog also support the plan.

Chairman Cotchett stated that the Commission would now hear from the representatives of groups that wished to speak. He requested that, in the interest of time, one person speak for each group. Chairman Cotchett then called on each speaker from the registration forms:

Dorothy Radcliff, Seabreeze – Ms. Radcliff stated that she is owner and partner of Seabreeze Market and Deli, which opened in 1979. She indicated that the Berkeley City Council members and the Waterfront Commission supported the Seabreeze's presence in the Eastshore plan. Ms. Radcliffe was glad to see an opening for a café in the plan. She presented the commission with over 9,000 signed petitions that the Seabreeze be permitted to remain in this state park setting.

Norman LaForce, Sierra Club – Mr. LaForce stated he had been the Sierra Club volunteer leader on the Eastshore Park issue for the past twenty years. He acknowledged the work of Ed Bennett, Sylvia McLaughlin, and Dwight Steele. Mr. LaForce referenced materials he previously sent to the Commissioners indicating the importance of protecting wildlife in their habitat in the urban environment. Mr. LaForce stated that the Sierra Club urges the Commission to approve the designation of the park as a State Seashore. He also stated the Sierra Club approved the designations of the Emeryville Crescent and Albany Mud Flats as Marine Reserves. The Sierra Club urged approval of the park general plan. Mr. LaForce stated the Sierra Club looks forward to working with State Parks and the East Bay Regional Park District on the implementation and management of the plan, as well as on acquiring the Gilman property so the Sierra Club can help relocate ball fields. He thanked the people involved in the project for their hard work and dedication.

Chairman Cotchett requested the Sylvia McLaughlin stand up to be acknowledged. He stated that she is one of three women that started "Save the Bay" in the early 1960s.

Robert Cheasty, Citizens for the Eastshore State Park (CESP) – Mr. Cheasty stated he was speaking on behalf of the officers of CESP, which include Tom Bates, Sylvia McLaughlin, Norman La-Force and Ed Bennett. He indicated that CESP represents about twenty different civic and environmental organizations and was established about twenty years ago to address the issue of creating this park. Mr. Cheasty thanked the Commission for having the meeting near the Eastshore property. He mentioned the history of work that has come before today’s vote. He thanked the planning staff for bringing this plan together. Mr. Cheasty complimented the team for keeping their perspective and sense of humor. He also acknowledged the work of Dwight Steele. Mr. Cheasty told the commission that this is a well-balanced plan, representing hundreds of hours of work and public input. He expressed CESP’s support for the designation of this park as a State Seashore. Mr. Cheasty stated that CESP urges the Commission to approve the final plan, adopt this park, and vote yes for each of the agenda items related to the park.

Jane Coulter, League of Women Voters of the Bay Area – Ms. Coulter stated that she represents the League of Women Voters of the Bay Area, which encompasses the twenty-one leagues that touch the Bay. She stated she is also here representing the Berkeley-Albany-Emeryville League of Women Voters. Ms. Coulter stated that there has been really good public participation on this project. She indicated there have been hundreds of meetings and the planning team has heard from many citizens. Ms. Coulter explained the League’s involvement since 1984, and detailed one member’s vision to create plans to enable this waterfront area to become part of a park. Ms. Coulter stated that the League is pleased that this vision is about to become reality, and the League urges the commission to accept and amend the final plan and support the State Seashore classification. Ms. Coulter indicated that the League would continue to participate in the process, and appreciated the opportunity for input.

Chairman Cotchett called on the several people speaking for the group, “Let It Be.”

Osha Neumann, Let It Be – Osha Neumann stated that he and Jill Posener were speaking for Let It Be, for 3,000 people who signed Let It Be petitions. He indicated that Let It Be had a few proposals that would improve the proposed plan. He stated that Let It Be wants to preserve the uniqueness of the landfill, conserve what is there, and that they propose a plan that gently controls the land without taming and destroying. Mr. Neumann stated their alternative plan does that better than the proposed general plan. He explained that Let It Be wants to preserve the appearance of the landfill, and create an urban wilderness that would allow the walking of dogs off leash and the creation of art. Mr. Neumann stated that Let It Be is not proposing anarchy; their proposals suggest a means of regulation. He asked the Commission to consider the Let It Be proposal.

Jill Posener, Let It Be – Ms. Posener stated that without the off-leash dog use at the Albany Landfill, the pressures on the other dog parks in the area would become unbearable. Ms. Posener stated that dog ownership is on the rise and dog owners need places to walk their dogs in different parks. She stated that the wildlife of the Albany Landfill has thrived with off-leash dog use. Ms. Posener then suggested that “...a bit of dog poop is going to seem harmless compared to the noise, air pollution, and garbage from the new Rancho San Antonio Mall...” which will be adjacent to the park. She asked the Commission to try to find ways of accommodating off-leash dogs on the beach, stating this was the only off-leash beach in the entire East Bay.

Rex Higginbotham, Albany Little League – Mr. Higginbotham stated that the Albany Little League is one of about six leagues in the area. He explained that the leagues need playing fields, and that currently their teams can only get on the field two to three times a week compared to people in the suburbs whose children get on five or six times a week. Mr. Higginbotham stated that this is a chance to get some property for playing fields and he urged the Commission to accept the proposal on behalf of the Albany Little League.

Jeremy Hanson, BMX Riders – Mr. Hanson stated that BMX Riders currently ride in an area next to Schoolhouse Creek. He recognized that this is a sensitive area, and is asking for a space to continue BMX riding in the Eastshore State Park. Mr. Hanson stated that BMX riding is a positive activity and that many children ride in this area. He showed pictures of the area to the commissioners. Mr. Hanson explained there are few other facilities, Livermore has built a public facility that is used free of charge, but an area in El Sobrante was recently plowed. Mr. Hanson stated that the BMX riders want to maintain an area to ride. The BMX riders have been using this area since at least 1990 and people come from all around the East Bay and the Peninsula to ride there. Mr. Hanson suggested relocating the BMX area to another place within the park. He expressed his appreciation for this consideration.

Martin Wendt, BMX Riders – Mr. Wendt stated that he has been involved with BMX for about fifteen years on all sides of the business. He stated the need for more places to ride, and that BMX is growing rapidly as a sport. Mr. Wendt stated that BMX riders would like to add a BMX facility to the park. He indicated the cost would be low, with little parking impact. Mr. Wendt explained that a BMX park would fit nicely into the motto of a park of the 21st Century.

Mimi Pennell, BMX Riders – Ms. Pennell stated she represented the mothers of BMX riders. She indicated that her 10-year-old son came with her for the meeting, and that by standing up and making a statement they might make history. Ms. Pennell explained that she sees the BMX facilities as a training place where kids can learn the right way to participate in the sport from people who are experienced. Ms. Pennell agreed that BMX riding should be considered as part of a modern park.

Peter Thorner, San Francisco Boardsailing Association (SFBSA) – Mr. Thorner stated he was President of the SFBSA, a 1600 member organization that promotes safety and fights for access for wind surfing. Mr. Thorner explained that while more shoreline is becoming public use, access for windsurfing has not improved. He acknowledged the proposed windsurfing launch in the plan is a great location, but that the parking does not offer effective access. Mr. Thorner explained that the gear weighs about 50 pounds and with a strong wind, it's not practical to walk out to the launch ramp. Mr. Thorner stated that this is the third park where windsurfers were asked to participate in the planning and didn't get real access. He stated that the access road already exists, and that they only want to get to a small part of the bulb, so the sense of isolation would still be maintained on the majority of the bulb. Mr. Thorner stated that the feeling of the SFBSA is that the benefit of having a real wind surfing access to the Bay is much greater than the small impact of having vehicles use a road that already exists. He continued by stating that the windsurfers require no fuel on the bay, but do require a vehicle to get to the launch shore. Mr. Thorner stated that the SFBSA can't oppose this plan because of all the years that have gone into putting it together, but is sorry the plan doesn't provide true access. He stressed that what is important is getting more people out on the bay on a larger percentage of the days. Mr. Thorner added that banning off leash dogs on the bulb will increase the impact at Point Isabelle because the dog walkers will go there instead.

Arthur Feinstein, Golden Gate Audubon Society – Mr. Feinstein stated he is the Executive Director of the Golden Gate Audubon Society. He explained that San Francisco Bay has been identified as a hemispheric reserve for shore birds with over a million shore birds coming annually. The densest concentration is probably within this State Park. Mr. Feinstein stated there are up to 14,000 shore birds at one time at the Albany Mud Flats and the Emeryville Crescent. Mr. Feinstein added that nature viewing is the fastest growing recreation in the United States, so this wildlife preserve will provide critical recreation for the people in this community. He also explained that having the preserve in an urban area allows kids from low income, diverse communities to experience nature. Mr. Feinstein stated that there have been more public hearings on this plan than any other process he has been through. He indicated this plan responds to the needs of the community, and urged commissioners to adopt the plan

and the classification. Mr. Feinstein added that the community can stop the development next to the park and make it part of the State Park by coming out to the meetings in Albany.

Susan Schwartz, Friends of Five Creeks & Berkeley Path Wanderers – Ms. Schwartz stated that she is representing two citizens groups, Berkeley Path Wanderers and Friends of Five Creeks. She further stated that their volunteer groups, each with about five hundred members, look forward to working on this park. They recognize the plan is a work in progress. She urged adoption of the plan.

Eleanor Yukic, PIDO – Ms. Yukic stated that she is the chairperson of Point Isabelle Dog Owners (PIDO), representing 2,000 household memberships. Ms. Yukic stated that 85% of the visitors to Point Isabelle last year were walking their dogs off leash. The membership gets along in harmony with the other people who come including bicyclists, rollerbladers, fisherman, windsurfers, and walkers. Ms. Yukic indicated PIDO works to preserve the natural environment and to ensure the wild birds are not endangered. PIDO has a monthly park cleanup to pick dog poop. Ms. Yukic thanked the planners, explaining that they have tried to meet the needs of the various groups. She stated that there will be many more people walking dogs at Point Isabelle due to the off leash ban at Albany bulb. Ms. Yukic stated PIDO endorses the plan and urges its adoption.

Margie Young, Pet Food Express and Tasha – Ms. Young stated that she supports PIDO. She has participated in the cleanup days at Point Isabelle and participates regarding the protection of the birds. She thanked the commissioners, explaining how nice it is to enjoy letting dogs walk off leash. Ms. Young then stated that she and her dog don't want a fence on north area of Point Isabelle called Battery Point.

Nancy Powell, Bay Access – Ms. Powell stated Bay Access is a non-profit organization dedicated to creating a water trail throughout the Bay Area. It is affiliated with a seven hundred member club called Bay Area Sea Kayakers (BASK). She is pleased with bay access in the proposed plan. BASK would like to see the boathouse developed at the North Basin, and they encourage environmental studies regarding migrating waterfowl be undertaken soon to create a control study group. Ms. Powell stated she would hope to see the minimum in terms of seasonal closure, as it would be during some of the best Bay water conditions. Ms. Powell reminded the commissioners of the marine reserves to the north and south of the area. She indicated the birds do not seem to be impacted or disturbed by non-motorized watercraft. She would like to see kayak regulation done with a gentle hand.

Saul Schumski, Cal Sailing Club – Mr. Schumski stated he is Commodore of the Cal Sailing Club, which has been in the Berkeley Marina since about World War II. They are a non-profit sailing and wind surfing club with about 800 members in the summer and about 200 members in the winter. Mr. Schumski stated his support for the plan, and specifically for year-round access to the boathouse and facilities there.

Doug Fielding, Association of Sports Field Users – Mr. Fielding stated he is Chairperson of Association of Sports Field Users (ASFU), a volunteer coalition representing about 30,000 players, many of whom will be using the fields in Eastshore State Park. He indicated ASFU's support of the plan, though they didn't get as many sports fields that they wanted. Mr. Fielding stated that acknowledging this urban need is a step in the right direction for State Parks. ASFU supports this plan because they've been assured by California State Parks that State Parks will assist in the designation of the land use and in the development of the fields, working with East Bay Regional Park District if necessary. He provided the commissioners with a detailed explanation regarding high demand of sports fields in urban areas, and the responsibility of State government to help meet the demand. ASFU feels that the Eastshore State Park proposal is a good model for the development of playing fields.

Jim Simmons, Citizens for the Albany Shoreline (CAS) – Mr. Simmons stated CAS’s support for the plan as presented.

Karin Nelson, Albany Waterfront Committee – Ms. Nelson stated the AWC’s support of the general plan, and that AWC doesn’t believe that private art should continue on the bulb. Ms. Nelson explained that artists use the bulb as private studio space, bringing tools, paint, cement, metal, manufactured objects, and other things into an environmentally sensitive area. She also stated that AWC thinks off leash dogs will chase birds and other wildlife away. Ms. Nelson had a couple of suggestions as an individual; that artists could be allowed to pick up debris to use in their artwork and take it away, and that the small beach south of the old pier in the Albany Waterfront could be made available for off leash dog access.

Jessie Washington, Richmond Parks Department – Director Washington stated on behalf of the Richmond Mayor, Erma Anderson, City Council, and the Richmond City Manager, they are pleased to be part of this project. Eight miles of shoreline will be added to the City of Richmond’s thirty-two miles of shoreline. He expressed his concern that the region needs more playing fields. Director Washington thanked the consultants for their work.

Chairman Cotchett added that the City of Richmond has been extremely supportive of the plan.

Tim Bean, U.C. Berkeley/Cal Adventures – Mr. Bean stated that he was Director of Cal Adventures, the outdoor education component of the Department of Intercollegiate Athletics and Recreational Sports at U.C. Berkeley. Mr. Bean stated that his presence today was to express Cal Adventures interest in exploring the feasibility of developing and administering the proposed North Basin boating facility. He stated that Cal Adventures was ideally suited to this task as they have been operating non-motorized boating programs at the South Basin in the City of Berkeley for more than twenty years. Mr. Bean stated that Cal Adventures serves about 4,000 people a year in summertime youth programs and weekend community-based programs. He reiterated that Cal Adventures was very interested in exploring the possibility of being involved and that they were looking forward to working with the environmental organizations regarding the diving and rafting duck issues as well as the many other local non-motorized boating interests.

Jean Siri, East Bay Regional Park District – Ms. Siri identified herself as a Director of the East Bay Regional Park District. She stated that she believed there were too many dogs on Point Isabelle, and that she no longer takes her own dog there. Ms. Siri also stated that to an extent she agreed with the people from the Let It Be organization. She elaborated by saying that she rather liked the old stuff, construction waste, etc. and that the artists working there had made some very interesting things. She added that the people from Let It Be has been very good stewards of the land (on the Albany Bulb), bringing their own garbage cans and painting over graffiti. She also stated that she and others had removed all of the star thistle plants in this area. Ms. Siri concluded by saying that Let It Be was a very responsible group and, and she suggested that the Albany plateau would be a good alternative to the crowding at Point Isabelle.

Paul Kamen, Berkeley Waterfront Commission – Mr. Kamen stated that he was Chair of the Berkeley Waterfront Commission. He congratulated the planning team and the staffs of EBRPD and State Parks for their work. Mr. Kamen stated that he believed the General Plan was an excellent political compromise in terms of the land-based uses, but that he was not sure that it represented a good compromise in terms of the water-based uses. He stated his concerns regarding the uses of non-motorized watercraft in the North Basin, and that while he understood that use of the water would have some impact on habitat, those involved must work to find the balance between what is probably a relatively insignificant effect on the habitat and the very critical access to water-related activities. Mr. Kamen emphasized that the waterfront can only be truly appreciated from the water, and that the use of the

use of the waterfront was critical for the long-term environmental health of the shoreline. He asked that when the Eastshore project moves to its design phase, that State Parks encourage the growth of non-motorized watercraft activities. Mr. Kamen pointed out the Commission's on-site briefing of the Eastshore was incomplete in that they only saw the water from the land. He then invited the Commissioners and everyone present to join him for a three-hour tour of the Berkeley Waterfront by boat.

Chairman Cotchett noted that he would like to commend all the speakers for groups as being right to the point and brief.

Briggs Nisbet, Save the Bay – Mr. Nisbet stated that he was the Restoration Manager for Save the Bay, an environmental education and advocacy organization with over six thousand members. He recognized Sylvia McLaughlin, and her colleagues, Kay Carr and Ester Gulick, who founded Save the Bay. Mr. Nisbet emphasized the exceptionally diverse wants and needs of the various Eastshore stakeholders. He commended the park planners for their success in dealing with the inherent contradictions of protecting wildlife and critical habitat at the edge of a metropolis while also accommodating the recreational needs of the Bay Area and beyond. He stated that Save the Bay believes that the Eastshore plan succeeds in striking a balance between environmental protection and public access, and between development of visitor-serving infrastructure and restoration of degraded natural resources. Mr. Nisbet stated that the restoration of the area's natural habitats is vital to the health of the Bay and its wildlife, and that it will offer park visitors and important opportunity to experience San Francisco Bay as a thriving ecosystem connected to creeks and rivers, the watershed, and to the surrounding communities. He stated that Save the Bay supports the naming of the shoreline park as Eastshore State Park, and its classification as a State Seashore. He further stated that Save the Bay supports the Eastshore General Plan as amended and Save the Bay asks the State Parks Commission to adopt the Eastshore State Park.

Chairman Cotchett announced that this concluded the thirty-eight speakers representing groups. He asked that the meeting adjourn for a three or four minute break before hearing the speakers who will be representing themselves. A break was called at 12:21 p.m.

Chairman Cotchett re-convened the meeting at 12:33 p.m.

Chairman Cotchett noted that he would now call upon the individuals who had requested to speak. He stated that he had the honor of calling on Sylvia McLaughlin, a founder of Save the Bay:

Sylvia McLaughlin, Individual – Ms. McLaughlin noted that she had not wished to speak on behalf of Save the Bay as she no longer serves on the Board. Ms. McLaughlin commended Briggs Nisbet for the job he was doing at Save the Bay. She stated that this was a very important and special occasion especially for her, and that in a way she couldn't believe it was happening. She noted that the dream of a shoreline park started almost forty years ago, when in 1963 the City Council of Berkeley voted against the proposed plan to filter thousand acres of open water and expand the city into San Francisco Bay. Ms. McLaughlin provided a brief history of the Eastshore property, from 1963 to the present. She then expressed her thanks to the Supreme Court of California, the State Resources Agency, the State Park Commission, State Legislators, the East Bay Regional Park District, and the many other agencies, City Councils and Commissions. She also thanked the planners at WRT Inc., and the many environmental and community organizations, the various special interest groups, and the many individuals who have helped to make this dream a reality. Ms. McLaughlin stated that she endorsed and urged the Commission to approve the plan for the Eastshore State Park.

Susan Synarski, Individual – Ms. Synarski stated that she was a local resident and avid hiker, camper, and bird watcher. She further stated that although she enjoys these activities, it had been nine years since she had been in a state park because she has a dog, and dogs are not allowed on state park

trails. Ms. Synarski stated that if the Eastshore general plan is approved as it is, thousands of people who currently use the Albany waterfront will be disenfranchised. She stated that she was disappointed in the planning process, as the people who actually use the Albany waterfront had been ignored. She further stated that when the Albany Let It Be group put up notices to help park users know about public meetings, the notices were torn down. She asked the Commissioners to think of the people who love the Albany waterfront and use it every day, and to amend the general plan to adopt the counter proposal of Albany Let It Be. Ms. Synarski then thanked all the people of the Albany Let It Be group who volunteered a great deal of their own time and money to fight the Eastshore plan.

Marsha Skinner, Individual – Ms. Skinner stated that she was a member of the school board in Albany, but that she was speaking as an individual. Ms. Skinner continued that her position with the school district enabled her to explain why others don't build playing fields. She explained that the Albany school sites were very small, and that they are desperate for playing field space. She stated that she suspected that the contention over playing fields was not over, and that she wanted to advocate strongly for the need for more playing fields. Ms. Skinner stated that she believed the artwork on the Albany landfill (Bulb) was an inappropriate use of this area and that she'd be happy to see the artwork go. She also suggested that a shuttle such as the one at Point Pinole Regional Park might be a potential solution to the concerns of the kayakers and the wind surfers, and benefit other users as well.

Rich Clark, Individual – Mr. Clark stated that he was a twenty year resident of Berkeley, and that he was possibly the creator of some of that rusty scrap metal that fills the Albany Bulb. He thanked those, including the Let It Be group, that had referred to it as art. Mr. Clark stated that he was present to express his support for the Seabreeze Café, and he identified himself as one of the 9,000 petition signers referred to earlier. Mr. Clark stated that he would like to see the Seabreeze Café integrated into the future plans for the Brickyard area of Eastshore. He stated that he and his wife were regular patrons of the Seabreeze Café, that it was a very good place, and that it was very well situated. Mr. Clark noted that he spoke for a lot of other people that couldn't be present today because they're working.

Fletcher Oakes, Individual – Mr. Oakes thanked the Commission for sitting and patiently listening to everyone. Mr. Oakes noted that while he appreciated this was an open meeting, he wished it hadn't been at 9:30 in the morning because many working people were unable to make it. He stated that he wished to echo the statement of Osha Neumann. He said that like Susan Synarski he wished the present plan had some allowance for the off-leash dogs or the off-leash art. He said he would like to see the Commission include the Let It Be plan in the proposed plan. He would further like the Commission to hold off voting on the plan until an amendment can be made such that the desires of the 3,000 who signed the petition to keep the bulb and the Albany waterfront as it is could be considered. He stated that he thought some of the graffiti on the Albany Bulb was worthwhile, and that many of those who object to the art would probably also object to the art at most museums. Mr. Oakes again thanked the Commissioners for their attention as they were no doubt very uncomfortable.

Barbara Speed, Individual – Ms. Speed also thanked the Commissioners as this had been a long meeting. Ms. Speed stated that she was a daily user of the Albany waterfront that she was pleased that Osha and Jill were able to express our feelings so passionately and succinctly. Ms. Speed suggested that in the light of a possible \$30 billion cut, the Let It Be counter-proposal is very cost effective. She stated that the proposal has many other advantages. She stated that playing fields are very inappropriate there (in Albany). Ms. Speed stated that disabled users of the park need better access, and that the Albany Plateau area is very important because many people can't walk far, and this area could be used not only for dogs, but for people, and that it should not be given over merely to birds.

Carol Bledsoe, Individual – Ms. Bledsoe stated that she was the guardian and the domestic partner of a happy-go-lucky terrier who can't swim, but loves to run free on the beach, she urges the Commis-

sion to consider a way to allow dogs to be off-leash on the Albany Beach. Her dog loves to do this now, and Ms. Bledsoe would like to allow him to continue.

Marilyn Saarni, Individual – Ms. Saarni stated that she was a Berkeley native. She urged the Commission to consider a modification to the preliminary plan before adopting it. Her concerns are regarding the Albany waterfront section. Ms. Saarni stated that the current plan totally disenfranchises disabled dog walkers. She stated that the City of Albany has no legal off-leash access, and that the Berkeley City Council removed about two-thirds of the off-leash dog access at Caesar Chavez Park and created a dog park that no one with limited mobility or a wheelchair can get to. Ms. Saarni stated that makes the Albany Waterfront, especially the plateau area critical to the disabled dog walkers of the area. She stated that Point Isabelle was overcrowded and not an alternative. She stated that the Albany area of the park is already naturally accessible to those who are disabled or have mobility issues, and that most of paths on the plateau are already accessible, and it's close to parking. She stated that companion dogs are often Golden Retrievers or Yellow Labs, which love the water, so it is especially important for wheelchair users to have access to the water. Ms. Saarni stated that the disabled dog walkers will have to behave illegally to walk their dogs.

Chairman Cotchett stated that he was sure that State Parks staff were looking at the issue of disabled people with dogs.

Jim McGrath, Individual – Mr. McGrath stated that he had worked on this particular issue for about twenty-five years, and that he was speaking as a wind surfer and a kayaker who's in the park about 150 days a year. He stated that he was also a member of the Board of San Francisco Board Sailers and the Bay Trail, and that he had worked on habitat restoration for nearly thirty years, and completed over 400 acres of wetland restoration in San Francisco Bay, and Newport and Humboldt Bay. Mr. McGrath stated that while he shared his windsurfing colleagues concerns about the park, he's going to support the plan with one caveat. He stated that the restoration of habitat at Eastshore will be extremely difficult as there isn't a natural ecosystem to restore. He stated that further environmental review on the projects that come out of the plan would be necessary, and he asked to be involved in the subsequent levels of project planning. Mr. McGrath stated that he wished to endorse the viewpoints expressed by Lisa Corona and Paul Kamen. He added that the planning staff tried to integrate both the habitat restoration groups and the access improvement groups, and he didn't see any inherent conflicts. Mr. McGrath thought that bringing forward each in a balanced manner would provide the support needed for funding and for stewardship. He saluted the planning staff for endorsing a collective vision.

Patty Donald, Individual – Ms. Donald stated that she is the Naturalist for the City of Berkeley and a past Save the Bay board member. She has taught environmental education for the past twenty-four years on the shoreline. Ms. Donald said she has run the international shoreline cleanup for the cities of Berkeley, Albany, and Emeryville for the past eighteen years. She invited the commissioners to go for a shore walk with her. Ms. Donald stated that the planning group has done a wonderful job representing the Berkeley. She expressed her hope that people walk all of the parks and look at them not as separate city boundaries, but as viable ecosystems. Ms. Donald thinks the overall land needs to be looked at seasonally and tidally. She expressed her pleasure that education will occur. Ms. Donald asked the commission to reconsider the dogs in the Albany area and give some thought to educating people how to best use that area, and have seasonal bans. She also expressed the need for shoreline cleanups every weekend, not just annually. Ms. Donald praised the ecosystem that is starting to develop in the Albany Waterfront, and expressed the challenges of dealing with the artwork. Ms. Donald stated her approval of the plan.

Keith Miller, Jack London Aquatic Center, Oakland Public Schools – Mr. Miller stated he is the owner of California Canoe and Kayak in Jack London Square and on the Board of Directors of the Jack London Aquatic Center in Oakland. He thanked Paul Cayman for his statement. He explained that he is volunteering in a paddling program with Oakland public school students, which is a first in the United States. Mr. Miller expressed the importance that these kids have full access to this park. Mr. Miller stated that he would like to see the North Basin remain open year-round. He stated that paddlers don't want to disturb the birds. He wants to educate the kids to become environmental stewards and the time of year where this park is needed the most, October to April, which is the time that's being proposed for restricted use.

Richard Wolgast, Individual – Mr. Wolgast stated that he has been on the Berkeley Waterfront Commission for eight years and supports the naming of the Eastshore State Park and also the designation as a Shoreline. Mr. Wolgast also expressed his hope that the recent acquisition of the Gilman area will provide a better location for the playing fields.

Ed Bennett, Individual – Mr. Bennett urged the commission to move forward with the adoption of the preliminary plan, the naming and classification of the park units. He stated that the birds are affected by people and dogs. Mr. Bennett expressed his concern about off leash dogs and even leashed dogs. Mr. Bennett wanted to associate himself with the comments made earlier by Norman Leforce and Sylvia McClaughlin.

Bob Arnold, Individual – Mr. Mr. Arnold stated he is a resident of Oakland and a former resident of Albany who has walked the Albany bulb many times. He stated his hope that the commission would vote affirmatively on every single one of the things presented. He expressed that the plan may not be perfect, but it's a beginning. Mr. Arnold then addressed the designation as a Seashore. He explained that the Bay is a part of the Pacific Ocean with the ocean tide flowing in and out. He stated that life on this earth began in the sea and that we all have the sea in our blood. He then explained that part of protecting the seas is protecting the shorelines and that's what this park is about. Mr. Arnold quoted the poet Lloyd, "I must go down to the sea again. The lonely sea and the sky." Mr. Arnold expressed his hope that the park includes places to go down and enjoy the lonely sea and the sky.

Shay Stephen, Urban Roots Prop. – Ms. Stephen stated that when the wind blows down the Bay that it carries the stench of refineries and the pollution from incinerators. She explained that while ball parks and recreation is important, that people need to breathe. Ms. Stephen stated that as many trees and as much vegetation as possible should be saved to keep the ecosystem in balance.

Norma Harrison, Individual – Ms. Harrison stated that she has lived in the area for about thirty years, and grew up in Chicago, where there was a legacy of a beautiful waterfront that is now being invaded by moneyed interests. Ms. Harrison hopes the people don't give over to interests that lay concrete and cement, and refine everything, and see beauty in barren places or places covered over with buildings. She expressed concern regarding the budget, which will limit how quickly plans are completed. Ms. Harrison stated her appreciation for the work the planning team has done, and recognizes that they are trying to do the best for everybody. She stated that she likes the idea of casual use, unorganized use, and doesn't approve of organized playing fields. Ms. Harrison also doesn't approve of having businesses on the waterfront, believing they have special privileges. Ms. Harrison stated that she is not a dog walker, that she lets her dogs come with her.

Phil Smith, Individual – Mr. Smith thanked the commissioners for holding the meeting and thanked the framers of the California Constitution for Article 10 that says access to the navigable waters to the State shall always be attainable for the people. Mr. Smith went on to state his concern that being overweight and 52, he can't carry a kayak or boat very far. He expressed that he and other older people would like to be able to use the park to access the bay.

David I. Tam, Individual – Mr. Tam stated his concern regarding public domain and the responsibility of Park and Recreation Commissioners. He stated that this park is unique as it has been privatized for over a hundred years, and he believes that this public domain should be restored for a wildlife sanctuary and for the scenic values. Mr. Tam stated that while he recognizes and respects the Commissioners responsibility to the broad public, he understands that the public domain and its constituency includes all of the citizens of the State of California and not merely those with local recreational needs. Mr. Tam submitted there is no more beautiful view from any landfill anywhere in the United States than from the Berkeley Landfill and asked that it not be compromised.

Philip Stallman, Individual – Mr. Stallman stated he has been a user of these areas for over twenty years, and wanted to remind everyone that it already is a park, and this plan is just finalizing the arrangements for its future. Mr. Stallman stated that the Albany bulb as the most sensitive part of the project, explaining that the Albany bulb is an area that doesn't exist anywhere else in the world to his knowledge. Mr. Stallman stated there was no reason to take the art away from the Albany bulb. He explained that it's detritus piled into the Bay, and it's been turned into a park. Mr. Stallman further stated that the people using the bulb for all of these years have been very responsible and civic minded. He stated that the planners may be underestimating the number of people who use the bulb on a daily basis. Mr. Stallman stated that there should be some way to preserve the Albany bulb as it is, perhaps make the trail safer, but not pave or allow vehicles out onto the neck. Mr. Stallman asked to not take away the art that exists and not leash the dogs. He expressed his hope that the planners could just white out the little tip of the bulb and pretend that it's not there. Mr. Stallman asked for a little bit of courage on the part of the Commission to find a way to accommodate what's there now.

Robert E. Doyle, East Bay Regional Park District (EBRPD) – Mr. Doyle thanked the commission for their patience and expressed EBRPD's appreciation for being a partner. He mentioned that this plan is not the end of the partnership, but there is a unique partnership for ongoing maintenance. Mr. Doyle stated this park has a \$3 million endowment, which pays for operations. Mr. Doyle added that the public needs to be rallied to the support of long-term stewardship as well. Mr. Doyle expressed his concern regarding the budget; there has been strong support for acquisition and development, but there's no money to operate these parks. He explained that EBRPD is concerned that after this plan is endorsed, that it will sit and collect dust because there isn't money to make it safe, to have the proper biological assessments and the stewardship to develop this park and take care of it permanently. Mr. Doyle stated that if that can't be done, the plan doesn't complete the vision. Mr. Doyle suggested that there needs to perhaps be a \$10 million endowment or a \$20 million endowment, and used GGNRA as an example for methods to help pay for operational costs. He stated that the people who love the parks can love them to death, and the parks have to be taken care of. Mr. Doyle stated EBRPD's commitment to venturing forward after this phase to see how a more secure source of operation stewardship funding can be created. Mr. Doyle further stressed that capital money cannot be used for operation maintenance. He stated that all the partners have worked hard to get to this point, but they're not done, and he said to keep the partnerships going.

Chairman Cotchett stated that in the interest of full discussion anyone who did not submit a form was welcome to speak.

Wendy Alfson, Walk and Roll Berkeley – Ms. Alfson stated that she agrees funding needs to be found to provide for the ongoing operation of all of our parks, but the GGNRA example should be approached with caution as it puts us back in over-development. She stated that the Bay shore needs to be preserved and restored, so public access as needed should be limited.

Alice Garos, Individual – Ms. Garos stated that as a disabled person it is important that the Commission think about the plateau for disabled people. She felt on mornings where she felt like she couldn't do it she would go with her dog and then all was well.

Frazer Bradshaw, Individual – Mr. Bradshaw stated that he echoed what the BMX riders stated about the need for a space in the new park. He stated that BMX bikes are smaller than mountain bikes, and the space would be much smaller than a sports field. Mr. Bradshaw explained it would require very little maintenance and would have almost no environmental impact.

Betsy Raymond, Individual – Ms. Raymond stated that she is very pleased that both Point Isabelle and North Point Isabelle will continue to be off leash dog areas. However she is concerned that improvements designed to invite diverse use will result in an influx of persons who do not own dogs, do not understand dogs, and may fear dogs. Ms. Raymond is concerned that this will lead to dog/non-dog altercations and she asked that in any future discussion or refinement of the park plan, Point Isabelle and North Point Isabelle be considered dedicated primarily to use by persons with off leash dogs with other non-dog users welcomed. Ms. Raymond explained the implication of this would be that in the event of conflict, the primary consideration would be to maintain this space as an off leash dog use area and to work with dog owners to assure this. Ms. Raymond expressed concern that there may be a time when off leash dogs could be phased out entirely.

Chairman Cotchett announced that this concluded the registered speakers. Chairman Cotchett asked if there was anyone else who wished to speak, or if staff had anything else to add based on the comments received. There being no further comments, Chairman Cotchett asked each commissioner in turn to make their remark on the day's proceedings or the agenda items now being considered.

Commissioner De la Rocha responded that she did not have any comments.

Commissioner Witt responded that it was exciting to have taken part in a process where people feel free to express their passion, their creativity, and their visions. He stated that everything that had been said would be taken to heart, that it would be studied, and fairly implemented where possible. Commissioner Witt stated that the planning process itself should be celebrated, and he expressed his thanks for having been part of it.

Vice-Chair Hart stated that maintaining the Albany Plateau as a space for hikers and disabled people to walk their dogs should be pursued if the Gilman Street area could be acquired and used for ball fields, which she agreed are essential to the community. Vice-Chair Hart stated that water-based activities were very important and that she supported the opportunities this park would provide for people who participate in those activities. She said she would like to see a method of transporting windsurfers to the water be explored, in that windsurfing is a great activity that is becoming very popular. She also stated that she agrees with the gentle hand approach to regulations on the use of kayaks. Vice-Chair Hart stated that she would like to see year-round access to the tidal area if possible and that she supports the development of a boathouse. She noted that the audience present lacked a minority representation, and that she was very much in favor of encouraging persons of color to use the park. Ms. Hart stated she was in favor of dogs on the Albany Bulb if possible, especially given that 3,000 people signed a petition in support of dogs on the Bulb. She thanked the planners and speakers for their work.

Commissioner Eastwood stated that he had enjoyed the process related to Eastshore, especially since he spent the first eighteen years of his life in this region watching the Eastshore area disintegrate into a flaming dump, what was then an ecological nightmare. Commissioner Eastwood stated that it was a great tribute to the people of these jurisdictions that they had gathered together and made this into the fantastic area that it now is. He added that no one he grew up with would have dreamed this could be

done, and that he thought the staff and various jurisdictions had done a tremendous job of working with many stakeholder groups that are interested in using this area. Commissioner Eastwood expressed hope that the area would become an important part of the East Bay and that it would continue to attract more people. He stated that he had mixed feelings about the Albany Bulb. He said that he enjoyed the artwork, and that he would have enjoyed playing in the castle as he was young. He qualified his enjoyment of this area by saying that the future of it would have to be one that best served the majority of users. Commissioner Eastwood added that he agreed with the comments made by Robert Doyle of EBRPD that the maintenance of parks is equally if not more important than the acquisition of property. Commissioner Eastwood stated that the jurisdictions of Albany, Richmond, Berkeley, Oakland, and Emeryville had done a terrific job of working together, and the project staff had done a terrific job of balancing everyone's needs. He suggested that everyone should be very appreciative of the work that had been done.

Mr. Cotchett commented that the tremendous level of public participation in this project, including those who had signed petitions and those who were in attendance today was extraordinary, and that the planning process that resulted in today's proposals was an amazing one.

Chairman Cotchett then asked for a motion to adopt the resolution to classify the Eastshore Project as a State Seashore with the name Eastshore State Park. Motion Commissioner Eastwood, second Commissioner Hart. The commissioners voted unanimously to adopt the resolution.

Chairman Cotchett then asked for a motion to adopt the resolution to classify 190 acres adjacent to Eastshore State Park as a State Marine Reserve with the name Albany State Marine Reserve. Motion Commissioner Eastwood, second Commissioner Hart. The commissioners voted unanimously to adopt the resolution.

Chairman Cotchett then asked for a motion to adopt the resolution to classify 405 acres adjacent to Eastshore State Park as a State Marine Reserve with the name Emeryville Crescent Marine Reserve. Motion Commissioner Eastwood, second Commissioner Hart. The commissioners voted unanimously to adopt the resolution.

Chairman Cotchett then asked for a motion to adopt the resolution approving the Preliminary General Plan and Environmental Impact Report for the Eastshore Project (now Eastshore State Park). Motion Commissioner Eastwood, second Commissioner Hart. The commissioners voted unanimously to adopt the resolution.

REPORT of NOMINATING COMMITTEE and ELECTION of COMMISSION CHAIR and VICE CHAIR

Chairman Cotchett reported that the Nominating Committee had met and nominated Vice-Chair Caryl to serve as Chair for 2003. Chairman Cotchett made a motion to this effect, second Commissioner Witt. The commissioners voted unanimously to elect Caryl Hart commission Chair for 2003.

The State Park and Recreation Commission then presented a bouquet of flowers to Sylvia McLaughlin for the work she did establishing "Save the Bay."

ADJOURNMENT

There being no other agenda items, Chairman Cotchett asked for a motion to adjourn. Motion Commissioner Hart, second Commissioner Witt. The commissioners voted unanimously to adjourn. Chairman Cotchett adjourned the meeting at 1:49 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
Ruth Coleman, Secretary