

# **CALIFORNIA STATE PARK and RECREATION COMMISSION**

Isaac Newton Senter Auditorium  
Santa Clara County Government Center  
70 West Hedding Street  
San Jose, California

## **Minutes of the Meeting - Wednesday, March 2, 2011**

### **COMMISSIONERS PRESENT**

Caryl Hart, CHAIR  
Alice Huffman  
Maurice Johannessen  
William "Bill" Kogerman, VICE CHAIR (elected at this meeting)  
Paul Junger Witt

### **CALIFORNIA STATE PARKS STAFF**

Ruth Coleman, DIRECTOR  
Mat Fuzie, SUPERINTENDENT, MONTEREY DISTRICT  
Eddie Guaracha, GAVILAN SECTOR SUPERINTENDENT  
Ann Malcolm, CHIEF COUNSEL  
Louis Nastro, ASSISTANT TO THE STATE PARK AND RECREATION COMMISSION  
Dan Ray, CHIEF, PLANNING DIVISION  
Roy Stearns, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, COMMUNICATIONS  
Kathryn Tobias, SENIOR STAFF COUNSEL

### **SANTA CLARA COUNTY PARKS STAFF**

Jane Mark, SENIOR PLANNER FOR THE MARTIAL COTTLE PROJECT  
Julie Mark, ACTING DIRECTOR OF THE SANTA CLARA COUNTY PARKS AND RECREATION DEPARTMENT

### **SPEAKERS REGISTERED/REPRESENTING**

Allen Baylis/Naturist Action Committee and Friends of San Onofre Beach  
Mark Blum/El Sur Ranch (registered but did not speak)  
Nancy Graalman/Defense of Place  
Gillian Greensite/Self  
David Mitchell/City of San Jose Parks Department  
John O'Neil/Central Coast Lighthouse Keepers  
Lynne Paulson/Washoe Meadows Community  
Marilyn Rogers/VEP Community Association  
Grant Weseman/Lighthouse Field Beach Rescue  
Doug Williams/Central Coast Lighthouse Keepers  
Jennifer Williams/Farm Bureau of Santa Clara County

### **CALL TO ORDER**

Legal notice having been given, Commission Chair Caryl Hart called this meeting of the California State Park and Recreation Commission to order at 9:52 a.m. Chair Hart began by apologizing for the delay in convening the meeting; she explained that during the night her car had been stolen from the nearby hotel parking lot. Chair Hart expressed her sincere apologies to the meeting attendees who had been waiting

patiently since the meeting's noticed 9:00 a.m. start time. The Chair then introduced the commissioners, California State Parks staff, and Santa Clara County Parks staff who were present.

**AGENDA ITEM 1:  
CLOSED SESSION**

Chair Hart apologized once again for now having to adjourn the public portion of the meeting to convene the Commission in closed session as noticed. The Chair explained that the closed session was being conducted pursuant to the authority of California Government Code section 11126(e): to consider pending litigation involving the Commission as defined by Government Code section 11126(e)(2). The Chair adjourned to closed session at 9:55 a.m.

Chair Hart reconvened the Commission in open session at 10:35 a.m. The Chair announced that there were no reportable items from the closed session.

**AGENDA ITEM 2:  
APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF THE DECEMBER 10, 2010 MEETING IN SAN DIEGO  
and the JANUARY 4, 2011 TELECONFERENCE MEETING**

Chair Hart asked for a motion to approve the draft minutes of the December 10, 2010 and January 4, 2011 meetings. Motion Commissioner Huffman, second Commissioner Kogerman. Chair Hart then noted that she wished to make a correction to the minutes of the January 4, 2011 teleconference meeting as the address of the teleconference location had been listed incorrectly: The correct address of the teleconference location was Sonoma County Regional Parks Office, 2300 County Center Drive, Room A120, in Santa Rosa. The commissioners voted unanimously to approve the minutes of the December 10, 2010 meeting and the minutes of the January 4, 2011 teleconference meeting as amended by Chair Hart.

**AGENDA ITEM 3:  
CHAIR'S REPORT, COMMISSIONER REPORTS/COMMENTS, RECOGNITIONS**

Chair Hart stated that she had no items to report and asked if any of the other commissioners would like to speak. Commissioner Maurice Johannessen stated that he had wished to make a comment.

Commissioner Johannessen noted that during these challenging economic times he believed it was extremely important to protect the valuable artifacts and other resources that would certainly deteriorate or be damaged in the closing of, for example, a museum. The Commissioner cited as an example Weaverville Joss House State Historic Park, where necessary maintenance had already been deferred for years. Commissioner Johannessen noted that he hoped private financing could be obtained to keep jewels like this park open, and that it was his hope that these treasures could be preserved for the future as once lost they could not be appreciated again. Chair Hart thanked Commissioner Johannessen for his comments.

**Recognition of Retiring California State Parks Employees**

Chair Hart asked Commissioners Bill Kogerman and Paul Junger Witt to each read a portion of the list of employees who had recently retired from careers at California State Parks. This list, representing retirements announced since the Commission's December 10, 2010 meeting, represented over 1,405 years of service to the citizens of California:

Dale Adama, Inland Empire District .....	24 years
John Arnold, Communications .....	24 years, 4 months
Jared Ashton, Off-Highway Vehicles .....	33 years, 7 months
Gustavo Avila, Orange Coast District .....	27 years, 1 month
Darrell Bennett, Tehachapi District .....	22 years, 9 months

Manuel Bergado, Public Safety Division .....	31 years
Thomas Bernardo, Off-Highway Vehicle Division .....	32 years, 7 months
Clarence Caesar, Grants & Local Services .....	25 years, 1 month
Robert Cairns, Sierra District .....	13 years, 6 months
Mariana Cashdan, San Luis Obispo Coast District .....	31 years, 10 months
Wesley Chapin, Channel Coast District .....	38 years, 3 months
Susan Chase, Sierra District .....	20 years, 5 months
Albert Chavez, Off-Highway Vehicle Division .....	31 years, 8 months
Sharon Dall, Colorado Desert District .....	11 years, 3 months
David Felton, Park Operations .....	35 years, 5 months
Sharon Fong, Information Technology .....	35 years, 2 months
Michael Franco, Orange Coast District .....	6 years
Lynn Froelick, Northern Service Center .....	37 years
Mary Giacoletti, San Luis Obispo Coast District .....	5 years, 10 months
Cheryl Halston, Accounting Services .....	11 years, 6 months
Charlie Harris, Grants & Local Services .....	11 years, 10 months
Beverly Havener, North Coast Redwoods District .....	18 years, 9 months
Meriko Hoshida, Off-Highway Vehicle Division .....	22 years, 11 months
Paula Huff, Diablo Vista District .....	13 years, 8 months
Geary Hund, Coachella Valley Conservancy .....	28 years, 9 months
Marie Hunrichs, San Diego Coast District .....	31 years, 5 months
Grant Jensen, Off-Highway Vehicle Division .....	31 years, 1 month
Ronald Larsen, Russian River District .....	7 years
Belinda Lile, San Luis Obispo Coast District .....	8 years, 3 months
Esequiel Lopez, Sierra District .....	12 years, 2 months
Felix Macias Jr., Russian River District .....	27 years, 3 months
David Marcuson, Santa Cruz District .....	34 years, 7 months
John Mckinney, San Luis Obispo Coast District .....	34 years, 6 months
Bonnie Morse West, Grants & Local Services .....	26 years, 9 months
David Olson, San Luis Obispo Coast District .....	19 years, 11 months
Linda Payne, San Luis Obispo Coast District .....	39 years, 7 months
Trevor Platz, Northern Service Center .....	19 years, 7 months
Karl Poppelreiter, Public Safety Division .....	31 years, 6 months
Charles Raney, Off-Highway Vehicle Division .....	20 years, 5 months
David Robarts, Colorado Desert District .....	31 years, 3 months
Diana Salter, Concessions, Reservations & Fees .....	18 years, 3 months
William Smith, Orange Coast District .....	9 years, 10 months
Dale Speers, Northern Buttes District .....	39 years, 7 months
Laurel Stewart, San Luis Obispo Coast District .....	28 years, 4 months
Bruce Stiny, Capital District .....	24 years, 8 months
Hollie Stotter, San Luis Obispo Coast District .....	10 years

Alan Tang, Planning Division .....	33 years, 3 months
Johnny Tirado, San Diego Coast District .....	33 years, 4 months
William Tod, Gold Fields District .....	11 years, 7 months
Stephen Underwood, North Coast Redwoods District .....	7 years, 1 month
Stephen Voorhees, San Luis Obispo Coast District .....	12 years, 6 months
Timothy Wallace, North Coast Redwoods District .....	24 years, 6 months
John Werminski, Interpretation & Education Division .....	36 years, 8 months
Herbert White, San Luis Obispo Coast District .....	27 years, 5 months
Steven Wilcox, Tehachapi District .....	15 years, 7 months
Ashford Wood, Russian River District .....	34 years, 11 months
Betty Wright, Diablo Vista District .....	22 years, 2 months
Deborah Yue, Personnel Services .....	21 years, 2 months
Morgan Zeitler, Mendocino District .....	25 years, 5 months

Commissioner Witt stated that on behalf of the entire Commission he wished to thank these employees for their extraordinary service to California State Parks. Chair Caryl Hart added that the commissioners were forever grateful to these staff for their dedication and wished them the best in their future endeavors.

Commissioner Alice Huffman asked State Parks' Director Ruth Coleman if it was unusual to have such a large number of retirements. Director Coleman replied that the large number of retiring employees was not unique to California State Parks, and that there were a great many retirements taking place at all state agencies. The Director explained that increasing workloads – a result of the increasing number of retirements and the restrictions imposed on filling these vacated positions – as well as uncertainty over pensions and other factors had resulted in a great exodus from all state agencies. Commissioner Huffman asked if State Parks employees were represented by a labor organization; Director Coleman replied that State Parks staff were represented by 15 collective bargaining groups.

Commissioner Huffman and Chair Hart each stated that the number of retiring employees was devastating. Chair Hart added that the increased workload on remaining staff had made their jobs all the more challenging, and she again thanked staff for their efforts.

**AGENDA ITEM 4:  
APPROVAL OF SPECIAL REDWOOD GROVES**

Chair Hart asked Commissioner Alice Huffman to read the requests to establish special redwood groves in California State Park System units. Commissioner Huffman read the following grove requests and made a motion to approve these groves. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bill Kogerman:

As requested by Save the Redwoods League:

Che and Mary Su Grove  
in Humboldt Redwoods State Park  
*Eileen Tsai, donor*

As requested by Sempervirens Fund:

The Wender Group Grove  
in Castle Rock State Park  
*Students, Colleagues, Friends and Family of Paul Wender, donors*

The commissioners voted unanimously to adopt the resolutions establishing these special redwood groves.

**AGENDA ITEM 5:  
PUBLIC HEARING**

Chair Hart opened the public hearing portion of the meeting at 10:48 a.m. The Chair explained the speaker registration process and requested that speakers restrict their comments to three minutes each.

**ITEM 5A:**

**Consideration and possible action on the Department of Parks and Recreation recommendation to adopt a general plan for Martial Cottle Park**

Chair Hart explained that in addition to the briefing and materials provided earlier to the commissioners they would now hear a short presentation on this item from California State Parks Planning Division Chief Dan Ray.

Mr. Ray reviewed details of the background and purpose of Martial Cottle Park. He noted that the state-owned portion of the property had been classified by the Commission as a state recreation area in October 2008, and that the park had been named Martial Cottle in compliance with the stipulations of Walter Cottle Lester, who had donated a large portion of the property and still resided there on what was known as the park's "life estate" area. Mr. Ray explained that the park's purpose was to interpret the region's agricultural history and provide related recreation opportunities. He expressed the property's value as the last remnant of the "Valley of Heart's Delight" in Santa Clara County and explained how the park would interpret the area's agricultural history as well as provide perspective to the community of San Jose.

Also provided was an overview of the management zones proposed in the general plan and specifics of the management agreement between Santa Clara County and California State Parks. Mr. Ray supplied details of the extensive public input process that had been employed by the county in the development of the park's general plan, which included an advisory committee of over 65 members, a task force of 25 members, four public meetings which averaged 160 attendees, and a mailing list of over 4,000 addresses. Mr. Ray explained that the general plan presented to the Commission differed from typical State Parks plans in that it included both a programmatic environmental impact report (EIR) and a project-specific EIR. He added that the Santa Clara County Parks Commission had approved this general plan in November 2010, and that the Santa Clara County Board of Supervisors had approved the plan in February 2011. Mr. Ray concluded by stating that a resolution had been presented to the Commission for their approval.

Chair Caryl Hart thanked Mr. Ray and asked if there were any questions or comments from commissioners at this time.

Commissioner Maurice Johannessen noted that he was grateful for the hospitality of Santa Clara County Parks, and added that he was pleasantly surprised to discover members of a family he was well acquainted with working at the Martial Cottle property.

Commissioner Bill Kogerman stated that he was currently involved with a similar urban park project in Orange County (the Orange County Great Park) that also incorporated agricultural and a farmers' market within the park. Commissioner Kogerman explained that the Orange County Great Park farmers' market had been highly successful even though there it had virtually no adjacent residential community. He said that with its large surrounding residential population the Martial Cottle Park farmers' market should be exceptionally successful. The Commissioner complimented the planners on their concept.

Chair Hart opened public comment on this item at 11:00 a.m. She reminded speakers to please complete a speaker registration form and proceeded to call three registered speakers:

- David Mitchell, of the City of San Jose Parks Department, concerning his agency's support for the Martial Cottle Park project.
- Marilyn Rogers, President of the neighboring VEP Community Association, concerning support for the Martial Cottle Park project and concerns related to additional pedestrian entrances added to the plan.

- Jennifer Williams, of the Farm Bureau of Santa Clara County, regarding her agency's support for Martial Cottle Park, the value of providing an opportunity for citizens to experience agriculture "up close and personally," and concerns for public safety and pest management that were yet to be addressed.

This concluded the registered speakers; Chair Hart asked if there were any unregistered speakers. There being none, the Chair closed public comment on this agenda item at 11:07 a.m. She then asked if there were any comments or questions from commissioners.

Commissioner Alice Huffman asked staff to address the concerns over additional pedestrian access points that had been expressed by Ms. Marilyn Rogers of the VEP Community Association.

Planning Division Chief Dan Ray noted that California State Parks was pleased to see access to public transit – the function of the access points in question – provided in the Martial Cottle Park general plan. He added that Santa Clara County Parks staff were best equipped to respond to this question.

Julie Mark, acting Director of Santa Clara County Parks, responded to Marilyn Rogers' comment that two pedestrian access points had been added to the project late in the planning process. Ms. Mark noted that the two entrances referenced by Ms. Rogers had been included in the Martial Cottle plan since its inception. She explained that she believed the concerns of Ms. Rogers and other neighbors to be related to how the City of San Jose's pedestrian trail system would eventually be linked to the entrances in question and how links would be provided to the proposed trails at Martial Cottle Park. Ms. Mark stated that these concerns would be addressed during the process of designing the trails and that she was confident that neighbors' concerns would be alleviated at that time. Commissioner Alice Huffman asked for clarification that this issue was not before the Commission today; Ms. Mark stated that this was correct.

Chair Caryl Hart asked if there were any other comments or questions from commissioners. There being none, the Chair noted that she believed Martial Cottle Park to be exceptionally important to the surrounding community and Santa Clara County. She referenced the aerial photos of the area that had been shown, which dramatically illustrated the dense development and lack of open space in the area, and she pointed out that the photos also clearly showed the 300-acre oasis provided by Martial Cottle Park. Chair Hart thanked the Santa Clara County Parks staff that had worked so hard on this project, and she acknowledged the generous donation of Mr. Walter Cottle Lester that made the park possible. Chair Hart added that it was her hope that Mr. Lester's donation and the park would serve as an inspiration to others, especially since donations had historically played such an important role in the development of the State Park System and would continue to be vitally important in the future. She also thanked the many volunteers and members of the public that had participated in the park's planning process.

Commissioner Bill Kogerman stated that he wished to make a motion to approve the resolution before the Commission to adopt the general plan for Martial Cottle Park. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Alice Huffman. Chair Hart asked if any further discussion was desired.

Commissioner Kogerman noted that during his military service he had encountered many heroes, but that this was not often the case in civilian life. The Commissioner explained that he believed that in retaining ownership of his property and making it possible for it to become a public park, Mr. Walter Cottle Lester was a true hero. Meeting attendees responded with applause.

Chair Hart called for a vote on the motion to approve the resolution before the Commission to adopt the general plan for Martial Cottle Park. The commissioners voted unanimously to adopt the resolution.

#### **ITEM 5B:**

#### **Consideration and possible action on the Department of Parks and Recreation recommendation to adopt a general plan amendment for Point Sur State Historic Park**

Chair Hart announced that in addition to the materials previously provided to the commissioners they would now hear a short presentation on this item from State Parks Planning Division Chief Dan Ray.



Mr. Ray reviewed details of the proposal for the general plan amendment and addendum to the environmental impact report for Point Sur State Historic Park. He provided a short history of the project and explained the reason for the general plan amendment. Mr. Ray explained that the general plan for the park adopted by the Commission in 2004 included a provision for utilizing the former military housing on the NAVFAC (NAVal FACility) portion of the property. He further explained that the buildings were subsequently found to be unsuitable for habitation, and that this general plan amendment and EIR addendum were created to make this change while also addressing a dispute with a neighboring property owner related to traffic that could be generated if these facilities were used for housing. Mr. Ray referred commissioners to the staff report and maps that had been provided, and further explained that future visitor use at the NAVFAC site would be supervised by State Parks staff. He also called commissioners' attention to an errata sheet that had been provided along with the general plan amendment and EIR addendum.

Chair Caryl Hart thanked Mr. Ray and asked if there were any comments or questions from commissioners. There being none, Chair Hart opened public comment on this item at 11:16 a.m. and proceeded to call two members of the park's cooperative association who had registered to speak:

- John O'Neil, of Central Coast Lighthouse Keepers, regarding the history of park and its importance as the only surviving example of a naval facility of this type on the west coast, and regarding Central Coast Lighthouse Keepers willingness to assist State Parks in any way they could in developing and operating the park.
- Doug Williams, of Central Coast Lighthouse Keepers, regarding this park's status as one of the smallest units of the State Park System, though it received some of the proportionally greatest contributions from its volunteer cooperative association. He cited Central Coast Lighthouse Keepers \$500 thousand contribution over the last three years during which State Parks had been unable to contribute any restoration funds to the park, as well as \$3 million over the last 14 years utilized by Central Coast Lighthouse Keepers to restore seven of the eight historic buildings "on the rock" (the lighthouse facility). He also expressed concern that the NAVFAC property had been added to the park in 2000, and a general plan approved in 2004, yet no development or restoration work had taken place at the NAVFAC facility. He reiterated that Central Coast Lighthouse Keepers were prepared to assist State Parks with efforts to ensure this facility would be preserved just as they had with the lighthouse facilities "on the rock."

Commissioner Bill Kogerman asked if the lighthouse was operational. John O'Neil responded that the U.S. Coast Guard operated the lighthouse, but that the difficulty of providing water at the facility meant that the visitor experience was and would likely continue to be restricted to day use only.

Chair Hart asked if there were any additional speakers; there were none. She then closed public comment on this item at 11:23 a.m. The Chair asked for comments or questions from commissioners.

Commissioner Maurice Johannessen stated that while he favored preservation he was also keenly aware of the need to provide public access and recreational opportunities. The Commissioner stated that it was his hope that State Parks would endeavor to provide access and increase public awareness of units like Point Sur State Historic Park so that citizens would have an opportunity to enjoy the facilities they pay for.

There being no further comments from commissioners Chair Hart asked for a motion to approve this item. Motion Commissioner Witt, second Commissioner Kogerman. The commissioners voted unanimously to approve the resolution to adopt a general plan amendment and environmental impact report addendum for Point Sur State Historic Park.

#### **ITEM 5C:**

#### **Consideration and possible action to adopt a revised Commission policy on the sale of alcoholic beverages in units of the State Park System – *Agenda item canceled***

Chair Hart noted that while this agenda item had been canceled, it was her understanding that Commissioner Bill Kogerman, in his role as a member of the Commission's Concessions, Enterprise, and Fiscal

Committee, had requested an opportunity to provide an update on this item for commissioners.

Commissioner Kogerman noted that he wished to make the commissioners aware that the draft alcohol policy was undergoing further review in an effort to develop a less-restrictive policy. The Commissioner added that he believed the revised policy met with the approval of State Parks Director Ruth Coleman.

**ITEM 5D:**

**Nominations and election of Commission vice chair**

Chair Hart noted that the Commission had been without a vice chair since the resignation of Commissioner Mario Santoyo in October 2010. The Chair added that the Commission's Executive Committee, currently comprised of herself and Commissioner Paul Junger Witt, wished to nominate Commissioner Bill Kogerman as Vice Chair. There being no objections to this proposal the commissioners unanimously named Bill Kogerman as Commission Vice Chair. Vice Chair Kogerman thanked the commissioners for their support.

**AGENDA ITEM 6:**

**OPEN PUBLIC COMMENT**

Chair Hart opened the public comment portion of the meeting at 11:27 a.m. She proceeded to call five speakers in the order they had registered:

- Lynne Paulson, representing the Washoe Meadows Community, regarding her organization's objection to the golf course expansion at Washoe Meadows State Park, the preservation of the integrity of this park, and the inadequacy of documents related to the proposal to relocate the golf course.
- Allen Baylis, representing the Naturist Action Committee and Friends of San Onofre Beach, regarding these organizations' desire for action related to their requests to restore clothing optional use at San Onofre State Beach, State Parks authority to designate clothing optional areas, and the potential for increased revenue should clothing optional use be allowed to take place.
- Grant Weseman, of Lighthouse Field Beach Rescue, regarding the management of Lighthouse Field State Beach, illegal off-leash dog use at this park, and a request to return the "Its Beach" area of the park to its pre-1993 condition wherein no dogs were allowed on the beach, off-leash or on-leash.
- Gillian Greensite, regarding illegal off-leash dog use at Lighthouse Field State Beach, her objection to off-leash dog use, and a request for increased enforcement of State Parks' on-leash policies.
- Nancy Graalman, representing Defense of Place, regarding her organization's objection to the proposed expansion of the Lake Tahoe golf course into Washoe Meadows State Park, and this organization's desire to protect this park from inappropriate uses.

Chair Hart asked if there were any additional speakers. There being none, the Chair closed Open Public Comment at 11:47 a.m. The Chair asked for comments or questions from commissioners.

Commissioner Alice Huffman noted that speakers had once again addressed the Commission on the matters of the golf course project at Washoe Meadows State Park and clothing optional use of state beaches. Commissioner Huffman asked staff to provide an update on these two issues.

Planning Division Chief Dan Ray responded to the Washoe Meadows State Park matter. Mr. Ray explained that staff were presently reviewing comments that had been received on the project's draft environmental impact report, and that a general plan amendment for Washoe Meadows State Park could be presented to the Commission as early as fall 2011.

Regarding the matter of clothing optional use of State Park System units, Director Ruth Coleman replied that no process had yet been implemented to conduct public hearings on this subject, and with the current fiscal restrictions of State Parks' budget this would likely not take place for some time.

Chair Caryl Hart noted that she had several comments and questions related to the matter of off-leash



dogs at Lighthouse Field State Beach. Chair Hart stated that the amount of off-leash dog use at this park, as presented by the speakers, appeared to be overwhelming. The Chair noted that she understood State Parks resources and therefore the ability to enforce on-leash policies were extremely limited. The Chair asked if something could be done to resolve this issue to each party's satisfaction.

Director Ruth Coleman responded that efforts had been made to resolve this issue at Lighthouse Field State Beach. She explained that State Parks had offered to sell the a portion of the park to the City of Santa Cruz for use as an off-leash dog area, and that this offer included allowing the city 35 years to repay the purchase price. The city expressed no interest in purchasing the property. Director Coleman also explained that while Lighthouse Field State Beach was a beautiful seaside property it was not a logical selection for a state park and would be better served in local ownership. She added that the City of Santa Cruz had constructed new off-leash dog parks since the controversy over Lighthouse Field State Beach had begun, but that these new parks did not seem to impact off-leash use at Lighthouse Field State Beach. Director Coleman also noted that she was uncertain of whether or not the beachfront property shown in the speakers' photos, which could potentially serve as habitat for the endangered snowy plover, was included in the property that had been offered for sale to the City of Santa Cruz. The Director added that while it was unfortunate that insufficient enforcement of dog on-leash policies was taking place this was not surprising given the high number of vacant staff positions at State Parks.

Commissioner Maurice Johannessen noted that he was unfamiliar with State Parks' off-leash dog policies. Chair Caryl Hart explained why off-leash dogs were not permitted at Lighthouse Field State Beach and other state park units. Commissioner Alice Huffman asked about the management of Lighthouse Field State Beach, and Director Coleman explained that while the City of Santa Cruz had operated this unit for approximately 30 years, legal action had forced management to revert to the state which unfortunately did not possess the resources necessary for enforcement of on-leash policies there.

Chair Hart asked if there were any other comments or questions from commissioners. Commissioner Alice Huffman addressed the speakers who had made comments related to Lighthouse Field State Beach, noting that while California State Parks staff shared their concerns the department did not have the resources at this time to enforce the requirements to keep dogs on-leash at this park. Commissioner Huffman added that she hoped this situation would change when the economic environment improved and more staff could be employed to focus on other than mission-critical issues.

Chair Caryl Hart suggested that those who wished to promote off-leash dog use in Santa Cruz should privately fund the development of a dog park where this activity could legally take place.

#### **AGENDA ITEM 7: DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Chair Hart asked California State Parks Director Ruth Coleman to present her Director's Report. Director Coleman noted that her report would be limited to information related to the park closure list that was being developed to accommodate the reduction in State Parks' budget. The Director continued as follows:

**Methodology employed in developing a park closure list** – Director Coleman announced that the list of state parks units to be closed in order to accommodate the current budget reductions was not available at this time. She added that although the list was not yet available she wished to provide the commissioners with an understanding of how the list had been developed for approval by the governor's office.

Director Coleman explained that the park closure list had been created to address an \$11 million reduction in the current fiscal year budget and a permanent, \$22 million reduction for subsequent years.

The Director noted that State Parks had been fortunate in that Governor Jerry Brown's office had allowed the department sufficient time to consult with park professionals and conduct research in order to develop a list that utilized more than simply a "net value" method for identifying units to close. She explained that the current list had been created in a way that ensured key aspects of California State Parks'

mission were served, including the preservation of specific visitor experiences and natural resources.

Director Coleman also explained that the current proposal for park closures was the result of much more than just the present budget situation. She stated that over the last six years California State Parks' budget had been reduced by approximately 44%, and she added that the results of these very significant reductions could be easily observed in examples like the lack of staff to enforce the on-leash dog requirements at Lighthouse Field State Beach as had been noted earlier.

To further illustrate the impact of many years of budget reductions, the Director provided the example that the number of State Parks' field staff (those working in parks) was at this time approximately equal to the number of staff working 32 years ago in 1979 – though today's State Park System includes an additional 500,000 acres and welcomes about 10 million more visitors each year than the system did in 1979.

She also explained that the long list of retiring employees reflected the fact that staff had faced a variety of challenges over the last two years and many were choosing retirement over continuing to work. The Director added that retirements, in conjunction with restrictions on hiring, had resulted in over 500 vacant positions department-wide, the equivalent of about a 30% vacancy rate. Director Coleman added that the only benefit of these staff reductions was that this could make it possible that no State Parks staff would actually lose their jobs as a result of the park closures, though many staff would still have to relocate.

Continuing in her explanation of the methodology employed to develop a park closure list, Director Coleman explained that State Parks staff looked both at past studies and the newly-revised state history plan to identify "significant stories" that could only be told through certain unique park units. She further explained that if a park unit provided the only example of a location where a specific story could be told, attempts would be made to keep that unit open even if the unit received only limited visitation.

The Director also stated that a similar approach was taken with the identification of natural resources, where units with outstanding, representative landscapes – "iconic" landscapes not represented elsewhere in the State Park System – would be kept open whenever possible.

Director Coleman also explained that lower-priority units, those that did not tell iconic stories or include unique resources, were evaluated based on their visitation and ability to generate revenue along with the physical practicality of being able to close the unit. She added that units which required a large investment in infrastructure would be more likely for inclusion on the closure list.

The Director explained that reservoirs were not included on the closure list because they were supported by gasoline taxes paid by boaters. She also explained that though a similar situation existed with State Parks Off-Highway Motor Vehicle Recreation (OHMVR) Division – the Division receives dedicated funding – the state legislature had proposed taking \$10 million from the OHMVR program, although State Parks and the California Department of Finance protested the legality of this proposal.

Director Coleman noted that State Parks was optimistic that efforts to identify partners to operate some units that may otherwise be closed would be successful. She cited successful partnerships like the one with Central Coast Lighthouse Keepers that had been referenced earlier, and spoke of negotiations currently taking place to partner with Sonoma County Parks for operation of State Park System units there. The Director also explained that legislation had been proposed to allow State Parks to enter into operating agreements with non-profit organizations, as this currently was permitted at only El Presidio de Santa Bárbara State Historic Park and at Marconi Conference Center State Historic Park. She added that current law permitted State Parks to enter into operating agreements with cities, counties, and local park districts, and that approximately 10% of the State Park System was currently operated in this manner.

Director Coleman concluded her remarks on the methodology of developing a park closure list by stating that the proposed list had been developed by park professionals in their best judgement with a thoughtful look towards the past. She added that the list was being reviewed by the governor's office and the Department of Finance prior to release to the public. Director Coleman stated that the park closure list had

been developed in response to State Parks inability to fund and operate all the current units of the State Park System, and she noted that the system – its importance – is “bigger than the parks department.” She added that the department would not be divesting itself of units, only seeking ways to keep units available to visitors given the current budget crisis. Director Coleman emphasized that it was most important to ensure that these treasures were not lost and added that there were no plans to “abandon” park units.

Chair Caryl Hart asked if there were any questions from commissioners.

Commissioner Kogerman asked the Director to provide examples of how some representative units may be addressed in the closure list. He provided the diverse examples of Bodie State Historic Park, Anza-Borrego Desert State Park, and Crystal Cove State Park. Director Coleman replied that she could not comment as to whether or not any specific park was included on the list. She continued that as Bodie was the only “ghost town” in the State Park System it would be a candidate to remain open, that Anza-Borrego Desert State Park, with its immense size, would be difficult to close, and likewise Crystal Cove State Park as the Orange County beach parks were very well attended and highly successful at generating revenue.

Commissioner Maurice Johannessen stated that he believed it was premature to discuss park closures.

Commissioner Alice Huffman noted that nothing was permanent and that the economic situation could improve. Director Coleman clarified that it was not likely that any of the current budget cuts would be reinstated in June 2011. The Director stated that regardless of what happened with the state budget the proposed reductions for State Parks would take place. She added that staff had considered the long-term impact of park closures, including maintenance and the avoidance of vandalism, in developing the list. She indicated that it was her hope that additional volunteers could be employed as the “eyes and ears” of park units, providing security when staff could not. The Director noted that although California State Parks currently enjoyed about 20 thousand volunteers the system could use and needed 40 thousand. She added that the situation required creativity beyond anything that had been seen before, and that there were opportunities as well as challenges. She also explained that concessions would play an important role in the years to come, and that park units with successful concessions would be more likely to remain open.

Chair Caryl Hart asked if it was possible for entities like the California State Parks Foundation to contribute directly to the operations and maintenance of park units. Director Coleman replied that this had not been taken place in the past, though the Foundation had made significant contributions to many specific projects. Chair Hart and Director Coleman briefly discussed the likelihood of engaging volunteers to provide ongoing maintenance functions like the cleaning of restrooms.

Commissioner Paul Junger Witt stated that he wished to compliment Director Coleman and State Parks’ staff for their efforts in addressing this very challenging situation. Chair Hart stated that she wished to second Commissioner Witt’s remarks.

**AGENDA ITEM 8:  
ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further comments or questions, Chair Hart asked for a motion to adjourn. Motion Commissioner Witt, second Commissioner Kogerman. Chair Hart adjourned the meeting at 12:15 p.m.

ATTEST: These minutes were approved by the California State Park and Recreation Commission on July 8, 2011, at its duly-noticed public meeting in Sacramento, California.

By:           ORIGINAL SIGNED BY           Date:   7-8-11  

Louis Nastro  
Assistant to the Commission  
For Ruth Coleman, Director, California Department of Parks and Recreation  
Secretary to the Commission



Meeting of the  
CALIFORNIA STATE PARK AND RECREATION COMMISSION  
Isaac Newton Senter Auditorium of the Santa Clara County Government Center  
70 West Hedding Street, San Jose  
Wednesday, March 2, 2011 - 9:00 a.m.

### REVISED AGENDA of the MEETING

1. EXECUTIVE (CLOSED) SESSION\* pursuant to the authority of Government Code section 11126(e), to consider pending litigation involving the Commission as defined by Government Code section 11126(e)(2).
2. Approval of minutes of the December 10, 2010 meeting in San Diego and the January 4, 2011 teleconference meeting
3. Chair's Report, Commissioner reports/comments, Recognitions
4. Approval of Special Redwood Groves – as requested by Save the Redwoods League and Sempervirens Fund
5. Public Hearing
  - A. Consideration and possible action on the Department of Parks and Recreation recommendation to adopt a general plan for Martial Cottle Park, classified as a state recreation area
  - B. Consideration and possible action on the Department of Parks and Recreation recommendation to adopt a general plan amendment for Point Sur State Historic Park
  - C. ~~Consideration and possible action to adopt a revised Commission policy on the sale of alcoholic beverages in units of the State Park System – item cancelled~~
  - D. Nominations and election of Commission vice chair
6. Open Public Comment (on subjects other than the above agenda items)
7. Director's Report
8. Adjourn

\* Please note that the meeting room will be cleared and will not be open to the public during the closed session. At the conclusion of the closed session the Commission will reconvene in open session to provide an account of any reportable events as required. The public portion of the meeting will begin as soon as possible once the closed session concludes. Interested parties may join the meeting at that time.

Copies of this agenda and the public notice of the meeting are available on the Internet at [www.parks.ca.gov/default.asp?page\\_id=936](http://www.parks.ca.gov/default.asp?page_id=936)