

# **Appendix D**

## **Architectural Resources**

## ARCHITECTURAL RESOURCES

CSP recognizes historic cultural resources within its system based on their eligibility, or potential eligibility for listing on the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) and/or the California Register of Historical Resources (CRHR). Only by applying the criteria for eligibility established by the National Register of Historic Places can a building, structure, object, district, or a landscape's historical and/or architectural significance be determined. Eligibility to the CRHR is also based on these criteria. A resource may qualify for the NRHP or CRHR if it is 50 years or older, or of exceptional importance. A cultural resource must also be significant within a certain historic context, as well as retaining its historical integrity. Historic contexts are those patterns, themes, or trends in history by which a specific occurrence, property, or site can be understood and its meaning made clear. A property must be demonstrated to be significant under one or more of the following criteria to be eligible for the NRHP or CRHR when evaluated within its historic context. Architectural resources that have been evaluated for eligibility for listing on the NRHP and/or CRHR within each of the CASP units are described below.

### Point Lobos State Natural Reserve

There are 14 architectural resources located in the Reserve. Four of these, the Whalers Cabin, Shop Building, Custodian's Lodge, and the Hudson House, are considered historical resources for the purposes of CEQA. Information on each resource is discussed below.

- **Whalers Cabin.** The Whalers Cabin is the last standing building of the Chinese fishing village dating to circa 1851 and is located at Whalers Cove. The cabin is a one-story, wood frame building with board-and-batten wood siding. It was listed as a site in the NRHP in 2007. Listing in the NRHP automatically places the Whalers Cabin on the CRHR. The resource was listed in the areas of archaeology and exploration/settlement, under Criterion D, with a period of significance of 1850 and 1933. The cabin and its immediate surroundings are rich in ethnic associations, including early Chinese and Portuguese history in the Monterey Bay region (Loesch and Runyon 2007:8-1). It is currently used as a museum.
- **Whalers Garage.** Originally this building served as a garage for the Whalers Cottage, which was used for a time as an employee's residence. The garage was built by State Parks the current use for the cottage and garage is as a museum and information center for the State reserve. The garage is a single-story wood frame structure with a shed roof, rafters, composition shingle roofing, and board and batten siding. There are no windows in this building and the north and west elevations are plain with no doors or windows. The east (front) elevation has two center-opening wooden doors with large iron strap hinges. The south elevation has a large display case attached to the eastern side of the exterior.
- **Shop Building.** The Shop Building is in the center of the park entrance area of the Reserve. The building was designed in the Park Rustic style and was built in 1934 and received an addition in 1946. The Shop Building is a wood frame building, rectangular in plan with board-and-batten siding. In 2007, CSP evaluated the Shop Building for the NRHP as part of a CCR 5024 review. The evaluation determined the building appeared eligible for the NRHP under Criterion A for its association with CCC projects and park development in California state parks. Its period of significance was defined as the years 1933-1942 (Bischoff 2007b:2). The California State Historic

Preservation Officer (SHPO) concurred with these findings and the Shop Building was added to the Master List of State Owned Properties (Office of Historic Preservation 2012). It is currently used as an office for employees.

- **Custodian’s Lodge.** The Custodian’s Lodge is located north of the Shop Building. It was also constructed in 1934 in the Park Rustic style and is similar in architectural detailing to the Shop Building. The Custodian’s Lodge was evaluated in 1991 by CSP as appearing individually eligible for the NRHP as a significant representative of CCC construction in a California state park. The Shop Building may also be a contributing resource to the adjacent Custodian’s Lodge (Bischoff 2007b:2).
- **Hudson House.** The Hudson House was designed by builder Hugh Comstock and constructed in ca. 1949 for the Hudson Family. The house is T-shaped and designed in the post adobe Ranch style. In 2001, the Hudson House was evaluated as part of a general reconnaissance-level survey by CSP. The resource was evaluated for the NRHP and the evaluation concluded that the house met Criterion A, for its association with the growth and early settlement of the Carmel Bay region, and Criterion C, as a significant example of the “post adobe” construction technique developed by Comstock (Doniger, Osanna and Smith 2001:2). The building is currently used as a staff residence.
- **Residences and Garages 4 and 5.** Residence 4 was built in 1949 and Residence 5 in 1953. Both were designed from a standard set of plans by the California Division of Beaches and Parks’ architect Edwin Kelton. Employee residences were built with minimal features following the traditions of the Park Rustic style developed in the 1930s. (Bischoff 2007a). Residence 5 was evaluated in 2007 by CSP. The evaluation found that the building did not appear to meet the criteria for the NRHP. Residence 4 has not yet been evaluated for the NRHP or the CRHR. Each residence has an associated garage constructed during the same time periods as the residences. The garages have also not been evaluated for the NRHP or the CRHR.
- **Rat Hill Residence.** Located in the Rat Hill area of the Reserve, this is a single-story residence with a front gable roof featuring exposed rafter tails, stovepipe chimneys and composite shingles. The house is sheathed in wood shake shingles and has replacement vinyl sliding windows. The corner entrance is set with a single-entry, glazed wood door. It is currently used as a residence for CSP staff. It has not been evaluated for the NRHP or the CRHR.
- **Rat Hill Shed.** Northeast of the Rat Hill Residence is a shed building that is a large storage building with two enclosed rooms at the north end. It is rectangular in plan and a single-story wood frame building with a side-gable roof with a shed overhang on the west elevation. This is a wood-frame building with board-and-batten wood siding, aluminum sliding windows, and a single-entry wood panel door. It is currently used for storage. It has not been evaluated for the NRHP or the CRHR.
- **Headquarters Storage Building.** This small, single-room wood frame storage building that is currently not in use. It has a medium gable roof, wooden shingle roofing and beveled board siding. The north elevation has a centrally positioned window consisting of a fixed center six-light, and three-light casement windows on either side. The east elevation has a single fixed three-light window that is now boarded up with plywood. The south elevation has two fixed three-over-three windows south of a wooden swing door that is the front entrance to the building. The west (rear) elevation has a two-foot-deep by ten-foot-wide addition with a shed roof and no windows.

- **Restroom at Headquarters.** This is a very small wood frame comfort station in the headquarters area of the Reserve. It is a single-story structure with a medium gable, rafters, wooden shingle roof and board and batten siding. Though the foundation is not readily visible, it is probably post and pier type. The north elevation, or Men's entrance, has a four-panel wooden swing entry door on the east side and a central (wooden swing) service door. There is a wooden lath privacy fence extending from the building and five feet across the front of the door. The east elevation has gable ends that are screened for ventilation and a single four-light window on the north side (Men's side). The south elevation is identical to the north elevation, and the west elevation is also identical to the east elevation. This building is in fair condition and retains much of its integrity. It also retains integrity of setting.
- **Kiosk.** This building is the entrance kiosk fee collection and information center for the Reserve. It is a small single-story wood frame building with a high gable, rafters, a wooden shingle roof, board and batten siding and a concrete slab foundation. The south elevation has a central dutch door with a four-light top panel and fixed six-light windows on either side of the wooden swing door. The north elevation is exactly the same as the south elevation with the exception that the north is the entrance side and the south is the exit side. The east elevation has a twelve-light window and a gable end with knee braces under the eaves. The west elevation is the same as the East elevation. The kiosk is in good condition and retains much of its integrity. There are few modifications to the original structure, but it retains integrity of setting.

## Carmel River State Beach

The State Beach contains the Odello farm complex, which consists of four architectural resources. None of the resources have been formally evaluated for the NRHP or the CRHR. However, the property, as a part of a larger area was evaluated and found to qualify as a cultural landscape and is CRHR and NRHP eligible at the local level of significance for its strong association with the agriculture of Monterey County as well as its connection to the Odello family. This cultural landscape includes the remaining buildings at the Odello farm complex including the Old Odello Residence, creamery/cookhouse, barn, and blacksmith shed (Garavaglia Architecture, Inc. 2016). Information on each resource is discussed below.

- **Old Odello Residence (Residence).** The Residence is a one-story wood-frame building with a rectangular plan, gable roof and wood siding. Its estimated date of construction is between 1932 and 1935. CSP inventoried the building in 1986 and stated that the building had no historical or architectural significance under the themes of agriculture and settlement (Woodward 1986b). That inventory, however, did not consider the residence's associated resources and did not consider the residence as part of a district. In 2007, Buehler and Buehler Structural Engineers, Inc. (Buehler and Buehler) conducted a preliminary structural stabilization and assessment of the building. The assessment noted that the structure contained extensive dry rot, portions were collapsed, there was sag in some of the floors, and that front and side stairs needed to be replaced.
- **The Creamery/Cookhouse.** The creamery/cookhouse was constructed between 1890 and 1915. It is a gable end building with shed roof additions on three elevations that were likely added to the building in 1925 (Woodward 1986c). In addition to a cookhouse and creamery, the structure has also been used as a bunkhouse. CSP inventoried the building in 1986 and stated that the building had a California Office of Historic Preservation (OHP) National Register Status Code of 4B: May Become Eligible for Listing When the Property is Restored to an Earlier Appearance (Woodward 1986c). That inventory, however, did not consider the residence's associated

resources and did not look at the residence as part of a district. OHP has since revised those status codes and the creamery/cookhouse now has a status code 7N: Needs to be Reevaluated. The structure had temporary stabilization added to several rooms in 1999. In 2002, Architectural Resources Group (ARG) conducted a conditions assessment. The creamery/cookhouse was described as being in fair/serious condition (serious condition meaning repairs were immediately needed to prevent additional deterioration of the structure) because of extensive dry rot and weathering because of contact with the soil. In 2007, Buehler and Buehler conducted a preliminary structural stabilization and assessment on the creamery/cookhouse and noted dry rot on the exterior siding and trim of the building.

- **Barn.** The barn was constructed between 1880 and 1910. The barn has three bays, gable roof, and wood siding. Roofing material is missing in several places and there are bird nests beneath the barn's eaves. The northeast corner of the barn was partially rebuilt in 1982 because of a fire. The structure was inventoried in 1986 by CSP. The inventory stated the barn was not eligible for the NRHP; however, it did not consider the residence's associated resources and did not consider the barn as part of a district. The same inventory indicated that in 1982, the barn was given a local designation as having local significance (Woodward 1986b). In 2002, the barn underwent a conditions assessment by ARG and was reported to be in fair/serious condition because of weathering, water infiltration, and pest infestation. The barn was also said to have instability evidenced by the failure of some roof structural elements and significant leaning to the west. In 2007, Buehler and Buehler conducted a preliminary structural stabilization and assessment on the barn and recommended a complete re-construction at the north bay of the structure. Several sections of the barn on the south elevation have already collapsed, rendering the building hazardous.
- **The Blacksmith Shed.** The blacksmith shed features a rectangular plan, a gable roof and wood siding. The shed has an estimated built date between 1925 and 1935. It was moved to its current location in 1955. A part of the blacksmith shed burned in the same 1982 fire that destroyed a portion of the barn. The shed building was inventoried in 1986 by CSP and that inventory stated the barn was not eligible for the NRHP (Woodward 1986b). ARG conducted a conditions assessment in 2002 and described the shed as being in fair/serious condition because of extensive weathering and pest infestation. Buehler and Buehler performed a preliminary structural stabilization and assessment on the shed in 2007. That assessment recommended further investigation for dry rot and reinforcing the walls. In 2008, CSP maintenance staff added exterior shoring to keep the building from collapsing, and in 2015 State parks completed further repairs to the interior and foundation to stabilize the building further.

## Point Lobos Ranch Property

Two potential historic districts, the Point Lobos Ranch Historic District (PLRHD) and the San Jose Creek Historic District (SJCHD), within Point Lobos Ranch, were identified by CSP in 2012 as part of the *Point Lobos Ranch Cultural Resource Inventory*. Both districts were inventoried and evaluated for compliance with California Code of Regulations (CCR) Section 5002.1 and 5002.2(a) and (b). CSP cultural staff determined that the two districts were eligible for the NRHP. Documentation for the PLRHD was sent to the State Historic Preservation Officer in 2012 for concurrence, and is currently being reviewed (Green et al. 2012:1,7). The districts and their contributing resources are considered historical resources for the purposes of CEQA.

- **Potential Point Lobos Ranch Historic District (PLRHD).** The potential PLRHD contains nine contributing resources and two non-contributing resources (horse stalls and shed). It consists of the headquarters of the Point Lobos Dairy started by A.M. Allan and his family in the late-19<sup>th</sup> century and operated by his daughter and son-in-law (Rileys) until the 1950s. Many of the domestic and processing structures of the dairy as well as pastures, roads, fences, and other associated features are located within the district's boundaries and would be considered contributing elements and character-defining features of the historic district. The spatial organization of all these contributing features to the potential historic district creates a vernacular landscape. The contributing buildings and structures in the potential PLRHD include:
  - **Loafing Barn**, constructed in ca. 1950s. It is a wood-frame building with two shed-roof additions. The central portion has a gable roof and it is sheathed in a variety of siding including horizontal boards and board-and-batten (Bischoff 2011:45).
  - **Owl's Nest/First Residence #1** was constructed in the late 1880s for the Brazil family. It was moved by A.M. Allan to Whalers Cove in 1903, and moved again in the early 1930s to A.M. Allan's ranch property to prevent its demolition during the establishment of the Reserve (Bischoff and Jimenez 2008:8). The residence underwent several alterations by the Allan family shortly after it was moved to its present location. The building is a 1-1/2 story residence with a gable and shed roof with dormers, wood-frame windows, and beveled wood siding. This house was repaired in 2009 and is an employee residence.
  - **Morales House/Residence #2** was constructed in ca. 1900. It has a gable roof with a shed roof above the porch, drop siding, and wood-frame windows. The house is named for the Morales family, who worked for A.M. Allan from approximately 1915 until the 1930s. During the 1940s the building was used by the Riley family as a rental property. The house was altered in 1959 with the addition of a bedroom, and again in 1962 with the construction of a carport (Bischoff and Jimenez 2007a:6-7). This house was repaired in 2010 and is an employee residence.
  - **Victorine House/Middle Residence #3** was constructed ca. 1900. It is T-shaped with a cross-gable roof with a shed roof above the porch. The house is sheathed in board-and-batten siding and has wood-frame windows. Alterations were made to the house prior to 1959 and after 1978, including additions, additional fenestration, and a wood deck (Bischoff and Jimenez 2007b:6). There is a difference of opinion if the residence is associated with Antonio Victorine's family, who were early whalers at Point Lobos, or if the house was occupied by a different Victorine family (Lydon 2006:15). This house is undergoing full rehabilitation and is intended to be an employee residence.
  - **Gould House**, named for the Gould family who sold the property to the Rileys in 1945. It was one of the original houses constructed as part of the Carmelito subdivision in ca. 1900 (Lydon 2006:16). The house was altered after its original construction and now has a gable roof with a shed roof extension on its east elevation. The Gould House is unoccupied and in need of repair.
  - **Hay Barn** was constructed in ca. 1930s (Bischoff 2011:44). It is rectangular in plan with three bays, a gable roof and shed roof with a hay hood and corrugated metal cladding. One bay is enclosed and it has wood siding. It has a concrete slab foundation with concrete piers supporting each post.

- Dairy Barn was constructed around 1900 and modified by A.M. Allan in 1924 and contained the most modern milking equipment available at the time (Bischoff and Schwaderer 2006:1; Lydon 2006:18). The barn is rectangular in plan with a gable roof, wood siding, and sliding barn doors. In 1937, a shed was added to the barn's east elevation by the Rileys (Bischoff 2011:24). The shed's east elevation is a series of open bays formed by six wood posts. It is enclosed with vertical wood siding on its south elevation and is open on its north elevation.
- Foreman's House was designed and built by A.M. Allan in 1908 for the dairy ranch foreman. It has a hipped roof, drop siding and wood-frame windows. The porch was enclosed at an unknown date. The porch has a gable roof with brackets beneath the eaves, fish scale wood siding beneath the gable, and solid brackets at each porch support. This house was completely rehabilitated in 2013 and serves as an employee residence.
- **Potential San Jose Creek Historic District (SJCHD).** The potential SJCHD consists of six buildings, an historic period archaeological deposit, and numerous associated historic period landscape features. The potential historic district also contains archaeological features such as a corral, a water conveyance system, power poles and lines, and landscape elements including roads, pastures, rock walls, fruit trees, and ornamental plants (Green et al. 2012:10–11). The contributing architectural resources include:
  - Barn
  - Main Ranch House (Milker's House), was constructed pre-1930 and originally occupied by Swiss milkers employed by A.M. Allan on his dairy (Bischoff 2007:1; Green et al. 2012:10).
  - Dynamite Shack
  - Back House was constructed by Edwin Silvear in the early 1930s.
  - Back Barn. The barn is wood-frame and collapsed in on itself.
  - Middle House was constructed in the 1930s and altered several times over the decades. It is a bi-level building with a gable roof, board-and-batten siding, aluminum sliding windows, metal-frame casement windows.

## References

### Point Lobos State Natural Reserve

Bischoff, Matt C. and Corri Jimenez. 2007a. Morales House, Residence #2 Building Recordation. September. On file with California State Parks Monterey District, Monterey, CA.

Bischoff, Matt C. and Corri Jimenez. 2007b. Victorine House, Residence #3 Building Recordation. September. On file with California State Parks Monterey District, Monterey, CA.

Doniger, S., D. Osanna, and P. Smith. 2001. California Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) 523 Forms for the Hudson House.

Loesch, Kurt and Nancy Runyon. 2007. United States Department of the Interior National Park Service National Register of Historic Places Form 10-900-a for the Whalers Cabin.  
<<http://nrhp.focus.nps.gov/natregsearchresult.do?fullresult=true&recordid=57>> Accessed November 2012.

Office of Historic Preservation. 2012. Historic Property File for the Shop Building.

### Carmel River State Beach

Garavaglia Architecture, Inc. 2016. *Historic Resource Evaluation Report for the Carmel River Floodplain Restoration and Environmental Enhancement Project*. Prepared for Denise Duffy and Associates, Inc., Monterey, CA and Big Sur Land Trust, Monterey, CA.

Woodward, Jim. 1986a (October). *A Cultural Resource Inventory of Carmel River State Beach*. California Department of Parks and Recreation. Sacramento, CA.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1986b. Department of Parks and Recreation Form 750 Historic Structure Inventory for the Odello Home. On file with California State Parks. Sacramento, CA.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1986c. Department of Parks and Recreation Form 750 Historic Structure Inventory for the Odell Cookhouse. On file with California State Parks. Sacramento, CA.

### Point Lobos Ranch

Bischoff, Matt C. 2007. *San Jose Creek*. On file with the California Department of Parks and Recreation.

Bischoff, Matt. 2011. California Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) Form 523 for Point Lobos Ranch Historic District. On file with California State Parks Monterey District, Monterey, CA.

Bischoff, Matt C. and Corri Jimenez. 2007a. Morales House, Residence #2 Building Recordation. September. On file with California State Parks Monterey District, Monterey, CA.

\_\_\_\_\_. 2007b. Victorine House, Residence #3 Building Recordation. September. On file with California State Parks Monterey District, Monterey, CA.

\_\_\_\_\_. 2008. Owl's Nest, Residence #1 Building Recordation. On file at California State Parks Monterey District.

Bischoff, Matt C. and Rae Schwaderer. 2006. California Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) Form 523 for Silo at the Point Lobos Ranch Dairy Barn. On file with California State Parks Monterey District, Monterey, CA.

Green, S., M. Bischoff, J. Ramos, and R. Schwaderer. 2012. *Point Lobos Ranch (Unclassified Unit) Cultural Resource Inventory Final Summary*. Report on file with the California State Parks, Monterey District.

Lydon, Sandy. 2006. *Point Lobos Ranch Land Use History*. Prepared for the California Department of Parks and Recreation.