State Historical Resources Commission
Meeting
Pasadena Council Chambers
100 North Garfield Avenue, S249
Pasadena, CA 91109
February 1, 2008
9:00 a.m.

APPROVED MINUTES

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
Donn Grenda, Ph.D. Chair, Prehistoric Archaeology
Alberto Bertoli, AIA, Architecture
Bryan K. Brandes, Public Member
Trish Fernandez, M.A., Historic Archaeology
Fernando Guerra, Ph.D., Folklife*
Rick Moss, History
Richard Shek, Ph.D., Ethnic History

COMMISSIONERS ABSENT
David Phoenix, Public Member
Julianne Polanco, Vice Chair, Architectural History

STAFF PRESENT
Milford Wayne Donaldson, FAIA, State Historic Preservation Officer, Executive Secretary
Stephen Mikesell, Deputy State Historic Preservation Officer
Patricia Ambacher, Staff Historian I
Cynthia Toffelmier, Staff Historian II
Twila Willis-Hunter, Staff, Executive Secretary
Tara Lynch, Senior Staff Counsel

*Commissioner Guerra arrived at 9:15 a.m.

I. CALL TO ORDER
Legal notice having been duly given and a quorum being present, the State Historical Resources Commission (Commission) meeting was called to order at 9:04 a.m. by Chairman Grenda.
II. **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

Chairman Grenda led the assembly in the Pledge of Allegiance.

III. **INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS AND STAFF**

Commissioners introduced themselves; State Historic Preservation Officer (SHPO) Milford Wayne Donaldson introduced himself and the Office of Historic Preservation (OHP) staff.

IV. **WELCOME**

Bill Bogaard, Mayor, City of Pasadena welcomed the Commission to Pasadena.

V. **APPROVAL OF NOVEMBER 9, 2007 MINUTES**

Chairman Grenda asked for correction, deletions or additions to the minutes. Chairman Grenda asked for a motion to approve the draft minutes of the November 9, 2007 meeting. Commissioner Rick Moss moved to approve the November 9, 2007 meeting minutes. Commissioner Fernandez seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried unanimously.

VI. **COMMISSION AND STAFF REPORTS**

Chairman Grenda thanked those who had assisted the Commission on the previous day: Jeff Cronin, Julia Garza, and Kevin Johnson with the City of Pasadena; Sue Mossman and Christine Lazzaretto with Pasadena Heritage; Teresa Grimes, who led the tour of the Rose Bowl; Steve Wright, who led the tour of City of Pasadena City Hall; Mary Jo Winder, who led the tour of Bungalow Heaven; and Richard Norton, the owner of a Greene and Greene House, who hosted a reception.

Chairman Grenda gave his report. The report is attached to the original of these minutes.

SHPO Donaldson gave his Executive Secretary’s report. The report is attached to the original of these minutes.

VII. **RESOLUTIONS**

The Commission gave the following resolutions:

A. City of Pasadena for its recently-completed City Hall Rehabilitation.
   The Honorable Bill Bogaard, Mayor of the City of Pasadena; Steve Wright, City of Pasadena Engineer; Karen Balchunas, City of Pasadena Assistant Engineer; Dr. Paul Jennings; Sue Mossman with the Citizens Oversight Committee accepted the resolution.

B. Pasadena Heritage, for its many decades of preservation advocacy.
   Sue Mossman, Lisa Montano, and Christine Lazzaretto accepted the resolution.

   Copies of the resolutions are attached to the original of these minutes.
VIII. CLOSED SESSION OF THE COMMISSION

Pending Litigation: California Register of Historic Resources—Lincoln Place Apartments, Venice, California

Conference with legal counsel to confer with and receive advice regarding pending litigation when discussion in open session would prejudice the position of the Commission. [Government Code § 11126(e) (1) & (e) (2)(A)].


Chairman Grenda closed the public hearing at 9:40 a.m.

OPEN SESSION OF THE COMMISSION

Chairman Grenda reconvened the open session of the Commission at 10:10 a.m.

IX. POWERPOINT PRESENTATION OF NOMINATED PROPERTIES

Patricia Ambacher, State Historian I, and Cynthia Toffelmier, State Historian II, of the Registration Unit gave a PowerPoint presentation on the nominated properties.

X. CONSENT ACTION ITEMS

A. National Register of Historic Places

1. Ah Louis Store
   San Luis Obispo, San Luis Obispo County
   Local Level of Significance

2. Bungalow Heaven Historic District
   Pasadena, Los Angeles County
   Local Level of Significance

3. Holmes-Shannon House
   Los Angeles, Los Angeles County
   Local Level of Significance

4. Lakeport Carnegie Library
   Lakeport, Lake County
   Local Level of Significance

Chairman Grenda asked the Commission for a motion on consent calendar items. Commissioner Brandes moved that the following properties: Ah Louis Store; Bungalow Heaven Historic District; Holmes-Shannon House; and Lakeport Carnegie Library meet the National Register criteria and the Commission recommends the SHPO forward the nominations to the Keeper of the National
Register of Historic Places.” Commissioner Guerra seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried unanimously.

Tina Miller and Julianne Delgado thanked the Commission for approving the Bungalow Heaven Historic District nomination.

Lisa Ellzey, owner of Holmes-Shannon House, thanked the Commission and Patricia Ambacher for helping with the nomination.

Marsha Sanderson, Friends of the Museum of the Lake County Museum, thanked the Commission for approving the Lakeport Carnegie Library nomination.

**XI. NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACE DISCUSSION AND ACTION ITEMS**

A. Apartments at 1342-1346 North Hayworth Avenue  
   West Hollywood, Los Angeles County  
   Local of Level of Significance

Patricia Ambacher presented her staff report to the Commission.

The owner of the property submitted a notarized letter of objection, dated November 20, 2007, along with documentation that argues the property is not eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places (National Register). Copies of the letter and documentation were given to Commission.

The City of West Hollywood is a Certified Local Government (CLG) with land use authority over this property. The City of West Hollywood’s Historic Preservation Commission submitted to OHP a report that the does not recommend this property for nomination in the area of history.

OHP staff visited the property on December 12, 2007.

OHP staff recommended that the Commission determine the property meets National Register Criterion C at the local level of significance and recommend the SHPO to approve the nomination for forwarding to the National Park Service for determination of eligibility with the following technical changes in the nomination:

1. In all instances, the property name be changed to Apartments at 1342-1346 North Hayworth Avenue.
2. Resource count changed to three contributing buildings and not four to correct a typo in the nomination.
3. Some minor technical changes as shown in the attachment to the staff report dated January 15, 2008.

SHPO Donaldson reported on what had transpired prior to the Commission meeting regarding this nomination. A letter was sent to OHP from Truman & Elliott dated January 28, 2008 asking for a continuance. SHPO Donaldson had a telephone conversation with Todd Elliott and Kathleen Truman of Truman & Elliott, who is representing the property owner and former State Parks Director.
Rusty Areias. Truman & Elliott and Areias requested a continuance but the SHPO told them he needed more information before he could remove the matter from the agenda. SHPO Donaldson also directed Commissioners to a letter signed by Pam O’Connor of the firm of Kaplan, Chen, Kaplan, dated January 31, 2008, that had been hand delivered the day of the meeting, which requested a continuance by the Commission, based upon new information contained within the letter.


Chairman Grenda gave the Commission a break at 10:40 a.m. for them to read the letters from Keho and O’Connor. Chairman Grenda reconvened the session at 11:00 a.m.

Chairman Grenda asked the Commission if they had any questions of staff. Commissioner Fernandez asks staff if OHP had any information about the original design of the apartment complex.

Ms. Ambacher replied that she did not.

Chairman Grenda asked Ms. Ambacher if she had any comments about the content of the O’Connor letter, including the suggestion that the Apartments at 1342-46 Hayworth may not have been developed originally as a courtyard apartment complex.

Ms. Ambacher replied that there is not enough information in the file to draw any conclusions about what was suggested in the letter.

Commissioner Fernandez asked again about the original design of the complex because it could be pertinent to the eligibility of the property.

Chairman Grenda suggested to Commissioner Fernandez that she hear the presentation from the public because her questions might be answered through public testimony.

Chairman Grenda stated he had been contacted by Rusty Areias and Kathleen Truman about the nomination. Chairman Grenda asked the Commission if anyone else had been contacted about this nomination.

Commissioner Fernandez stated she was contacted by Rusty Areias, and she told him she will look at the information. Commissioner Fernandez stated that she used to work with the firm of Jones and Stokes, which had previously evaluated the property, but that she has no current connections with the firm.

Commissioners Guerra and Brandes stated they had been contacted by Rusty Areias.
Commissioner Moss stated he too was contacted by Rusty Areias but did not have the opportunity to return the call.

Commissioner Shek stated he was not contacted on this matter.

Heavenly Wilson, who wrote the nomination, spoke in support of it. She stated the nomination is supported by the Los Angeles Conservancy and the National Trust.

Michael Buhler, Director of Advocacy, Los Angeles Conservancy, spoke in support of the nomination.

George Credle, resident of the City of West Hollywood and former Historic Preservation Commissioner in West Hollywood, urged the Commission to move forward with the nomination.

William Neish spoke of the importance of the L–shaped courtyard plan of this property. He mentioned how often James Tice, an author of a book on courtyard housing in Southern California, would bring his students for studio study to inspire them.

Susan Canjura, resident of West Hollywood, also spoke of the importance of the L–shape courtyard.

Allegra Allison spoke in support of the nomination.

Michael Dubelko, the property owner, stated the property’s history was difficult to understand. He opposes the nomination.

Todd Elliott, attorney representing Mr. Dubelko, stated that he objects to sending this nomination to the Keeper of the National Register. He raised questions about the significance and integrity of the property. Mr. Elliott observed that the City of West Hollywood is a Certified Local Government and that the Planning Commission certified an Environmental Impact Report (EIR) that concludes this property is not a historical resource.

Heavenly Wilson and George Credle addressed the points raised by Messrs. Dubelko and Elliott.

Todd Elliott and Michael Dubelko reiterated their earlier contention that this property lacks significance and integrity.

Chairman Grenda closed the discussion for public comment and opened the discussion for the Commissioners.

Chairman Grenda explained to the public how the nominations being forwarded to the Keeper are processed. Chairman Grenda asked for Tara Lynch, Counsel to further explain the process.
Ms. Lynch explained the determination of eligibility process, through which a property may be determined eligible but not listed in the National Register, where the owner of the property objects to such listing.

SHPO Donaldson reiterated that if a nomination is sent to The Keeper for a determination of eligibility, the property owner can still appeal to The Keeper.

Chairman Grenda noted that the architectural historian member of the Commission, Julianne Polanco, was absent from the meeting.

Commissioner Fernandez asked Ms. Ambacher whether the front structure on the property was originally designed as a house or as an apartment.

Ms. Ambacher responded she did not know because there are no building permits to indicate if the building was originally built as a house or an apartment. Commissioner Fernandez had questions about the comparative massing of the two structures. Ms. Ambacher presented Commissioner Fernandez the photographs of the property.

Commissioner Fernandez noted that opponents to this nomination had raised questions about the quality of workmanship of the apartment complex, relative to other apartment buildings of a similar design. Commissioner Fernandez asked Ms. Ambacher to state the criteria and area of significance under which the property was nominated.

Ms. Ambacher stated it was nominated under Criterion C in the area of Architecture and read the reasons that were stated in the nomination.

Chairman Grenda addressed the issue of integrity, relative to modifications that had been mentioned in the public testimony – awnings, additions, and other matters, asking whether the Commission could consider the reversibility of such modifications. SHPO Donaldson advised the Commission to consider the property exactly as it appears today.

Commissioner Fernandez asked staff about the importance of similar courtyard apartments on the same block in evaluating potential significance for this property.

Ms. Ambacher replied that under the National Register once a context has been developed, it is not necessary to compare a specific property against other examples of the same property type. Ms. Ambacher read from the National Register Bulletin 15, page 9.

Commissioner Fernandez noted that public testimony has raised questions about whether this property was associated with the “Golden Age” of Hollywood.

Ms. Ambacher responded, saying that the period of significance is 1924, which is the date of construction, noting that the nomination form does not argue the property is significant as part of the “Golden Age” of the film industry.
Commissioner Moss expressed his appreciation to both the proponents and opponents for the nomination. Commissioner Moss asked Ms. Ambacher whether, in her view, the property retains good integrity.

Ms. Ambacher stated she visited the property from the public right of way, and in her opinion the property retains integrity.

Commissioner Fernandez asked Ms. Ambacher to identify the aspects of integrity the property retains and how those aspects relate to the character defining features of the property.

Ms. Ambacher stated the property, in her view, retains integrity of location and design, as well as materials, workmanship, feeling, association, and setting.

Commissioner Shek raised several issues about how this property should be evaluated. First, he questioned whether the Sanborn Fire Insurance Map information, referenced in the January 31st letter from Kaplan Chen Kaplan was really “new information,” or whether it had been known when previous evaluation reports had been prepared. Second, he inquired about the importance of the fact that other notable courtyard apartments existed in close proximity to the property in question.

Ms. Ambacher answered Commissioner Shek’s questions by stating as to why the Sanborn maps were introduced as new evidence, Ms. Ambacher could not comment on that question but that the maps were mentioned in the EIR document.

Commissioner Shek asked whether the West Hollywood Historical Preservation Commission had evaluated the property that had deemed it ineligible, or whether it had the full evaluation, if not, why?

SHPO Donaldson answered the question by explaining how a certified local government nomination is processed.

Commissioner Guerra asked staff to clarify the role of a CLG in nominating properties to the National Register. SHPO Donaldson, Ms. Ambacher, and Ms. Lynch outlined the general process.

Ms. Lynch noted that the key provision is included in Section 101(c)(2) of the National Historic Preservation Act. Under that section, the SHPO may not process a nomination for a property that is not supported by the historic preservation commission and the chief elected official of the CLG.

Commissioners Guerra and Fernandez inquired about the position of the historic preservation commission and the mayor of West Hollywood, relative to this nomination. SHPO Donaldson and Ms. Ambacher observed that OHP had received a letter of non-support from the local commission but had not received any correspondence from the mayor’s office.
Commissioner Guerra pointed out that every action by the City of West Hollywood that he had seen had been to oppose this nomination. Chairman Grenda agreed with that observation.

Commissioner Shek wanted to know if there were other L-shaped courtyard designs on the same block listed on the National Register. Ms. Ambacher stated she did not have that information in front of her.

Commissioner Bertoli asked staff for any information it might have regarding whether the buildings in the apartment complex were built at the same time. Ms. Ambacher replied that all available information was contained within the nomination.

Commissioner Guerra also asked staff about the construction chronology for the complex, specifically whether all of the buildings at the complex were built at the same time. Ms. Ambacher answered that all available information indicates that the complex was built in 1924, except for one garage, which was built in 1953.

Commissioner Guerra stated he would be comfortable continuing the matter until more information becomes available.

Chairman Grenda stated he will listen for a motion from the Commission.

Commissioner Moss moved that the Commission continue the matter of 1342-1346 North Hayworth to the next regularly scheduled Commission meeting in April, 2008. Commissioner Guerra seconded the motion.

Commissioner Fernandez asked if there would be any negative effects associated with delaying a decision.

Commissioner Shek stated that demolition has been delayed and so continuing it might affect his vote.

Chairman Grenda stated the Commission cannot consider demolition or any other issue, apart from the National Register eligibility criteria. SHPO Donaldson and Ms. Lynch agreed, stating that the Commission should only consider National Register eligibility criteria in making its decision.

Commissioner Fernandez asked what specific information the Commission would like to have that would change the nomination.

Chairman Grenda stated Commissioner Polanco would have an opinion that is important.

Commissioner Guerra stated that he will not be supportive of this nomination as long as the local government is against it. He also would like to see more information about the structures, particularly with regard to points made in the Kaplan Chen Kaplan letter and graphics.

SHPO Donaldson asked Commissioner Guerra if he wanted information on the construction chronology.
Chairman Grenda stated that chronology is important.

Commissioner Guerra stated he also wants more clarity regarding the position of the City of West Hollywood regarding this nomination.

SHPO Donaldson asks the Commission if they would like the staff to clarify the position of the mayor on this nomination. SHPO Donaldson stated that, if the motion were approved, OHP staff would write a letter to the city, asking both the mayor and the local commission to clarify their position with regard to this nomination.

Commissioner Moss said that he agreed with Commissioner Guerra in his desire to be fair to both parties and to give the opponents a chance to gather more information.

Commissioner Bertoli asked for the motion to be repeated.

Commissioner Moss moved that the Commission continue the matter of the Apartments at 1342-1346 North Hayworth to the next regular scheduled meeting of the State Historical Resources Commission. Commissioner Guerra seconded the motion.

Chairman Grenda asks the Commission for a roll call vote.

Commissioner Guerra—yes
Commissioner Bertoli—yes
Commissioner Brandes—yes
Commissioner Moss—yes
Chairman Grenda—yes
Commissioner Shek—no
Commissioner Fernandez—abstain

Action: Motion carried, five yes, one no, one abstention.

Commissioner Guerra asked what the Commission is directing staff to do in preparation for the next meeting.

SHPO Donaldson stated to the Commission that staff will, in preparation for the next meeting, 1) Ask the application to verify the construction chronology; 2) Get a letter from the Planning Commission; and 3) Write a letter to the Mayor, seeking his position on the nomination.

Commissioner Guerra asked Ms. Ambacher to make sure the Commissioner receives all current material relating to the nomination.

The Commission broke for lunch at 1:00 p.m. and reconvened at 1:54 p.m.

XII. PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no public comments.
XIII. COMMISSIONERS’ REPORTS

Archaeological Resources Committee – Commissioner Fernandez, Chair had no report.

Cultural Diversity Committee – Commissioner Moss, Chair had no report.

Information Center Procedural Advisory Commission – Commissioner Grenda, Chair referred to SHPO Donaldson for the report. The report is attached to the original of these minutes. SHPO Donaldson reported the last edition of the operations manual has been signed off on. There will be a change in the digital fees. The operations manual will be coming to the Commission for their approval. Modern and Cultural Resources Committee – Commissioner Polanco, Chair had no report.

Public Policy and Legislation Committee – Commissioners Fernandez and Polanco, Co-Chairs had no report.

State Historical Building Safety Code Committee – Commissioner Bertoli, Chair referred to SHPO Donaldson for the report. The report is attached to the original of these minutes. SHPO Donaldson attended the meeting by teleconference that was held in Alameda. The discussion was based on the structural elements values currently in the existing building codes. These codes will be on OHP’s website. The 2000 revisions were accepted by the Building Standards Commission.

Yearly Goals and Objectives Committee – Commissioner Brandes, Chair had no report.

XIV. COMMISSION DISCUSSION AND ACTION ITEMS

A. 2008 Committee Formation and Assignments

Chairman Grenda stated the 2008 Committee Formation and Assignments were assigned at the SHRC Workshop.

B. Norconian Club Resolution

Gini Austerman, Norco Regional Conservancy gave the Commission an update on this progress surrounding the preservation of this property since the last Commission meeting.

Councilmember Kathy Azevedo of the City of Norco reiterated Gini Austerman’s comments and asked for the Commission’s help.

Chairman Grenda stated he and Deputy SHPO Stephen Mikesell has been working together in writing a letter demonstrating the Commission’s support for the preservation of this property.
Kevin Bash addressed the Commission and urged their support in preserving this property.

Chairman Grenda asked the Commission for a motion. Commission Brandes moved to direct staff to send a letter to the state warden expressing concern to get the electricity turned on. Commissioner Bertoli seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried unanimously.

**XV. ADJOURNMENT**

Chairman Grenda adjourned the regular meeting of the Commission at 2:34 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

_______________________________               _________________
Milford Wayne Donaldson FAIA                           Date
State Historic Preservation Officer
Attachment A – Chairman’s Report

Chairman Grenda reported on his activities since the November 9, 2007 Commission meeting.

- Participated in a series of emails and teleconference with the Archaeological Committee lead by Commissioner Fernandez.

- Continued to advise a group of preservationist working to save the historic Lake Norconian Club from neglect.

- Early December gave a presentation to the San Bernardino Historical and Pioneer Society, entitled the Archaeology in the Private Sector and How to Nominate Properties to National Register to Historical Places. Chairman Grenda plan to present this presentation to a series of historical societies throughout California to raise awareness and to promote historic preservation.

- In early January attended the Annual Conference of the Society for Historical Archaeology in Albuquerque, New Mexico. Chairman Grenda presented a paper on recent advances in archaeological methods for large scale data recovery projects.

- Attended for the first time a meeting of the Native American Heritage Commission.

- Chairman Grenda gave an update report from the last Commission meeting on the Burrage Mansion in the City of Redlands, which is threatened with property subdivision on the surrounding grounds. The property was sold by one individual who decided not to subdivide the property. Chairman Grenda has been working with groups to convince the owners that the property is part of the landscape, so it is a victory for historic preservation in Redlands.

Attachment B – Executive Secretary’s Report

- The Landmarks Program, which began in 1932 through the efforts of Charles Lummis and others celebrated its 75th Anniversary.

- The OHP newsletter Preservation Matters, is now available on OHP’s website, www.ohp.parks.ca.gov.

- He has been actively involved with a committee of the National Park Service, tasked with developing a unified national cultural database structure. The National Parks Service has a $3.5 million grant to get everything on the National Register of Historic Places on digital format so the public have access to the database.
• There are 2,000 major updates and additions to the California Historic Building Codes; these are available on OHP’s website www.ohp.parks.ca.gov.

• There will be a Main Street Annual Meeting in Sacramento on February 25-27, 2008.

• On March 1-6, 2008, the National Conference of State Historic Preservation Officers will hold its annual meeting in Washington, D.C. OHP will participate in several parts of this meeting.

• On April 10-12, 2008, the National Trust of Historic Preservation will hold a partners’ meeting in San Diego.

    On April 23-25, 2008, the California Preservation Foundation Conference will be held in Napa. The SHPO and Deputy SHPO will present a question and answer session there.

• The governor is asking for 10% reduction from all of state agencies. OHP is looking for ways to save money.

• SHPO Donaldson thanked Claire Bogaard, former chair of the State Historical Resources Commission, and her husband, Mayor Bill Bogaard for attending the Commission meeting.